Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

Herausgeber / Editor Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber / Associate Editors Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala) Hans-Josef Klauck (Chicago, IL) · Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)

379



Jan N. Bremmer

Maidens, Magic and Martyrs in Early Christianity

Collected Essays I

Jan N. Bremm Groningen.	<i>er</i> , born 1944	4; Emeritus	Professor	of Religious	Studies	at the	University of

ISBN 978-3-16-154450-7

ISSN 0512-1604 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament)

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at http://dnb.dnb.de.

© 2017 by Mohr Siebeck, Tübingen, Germany. www.mohr.de

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was typeset and printed on non-aging paper by Gulde Druck in Tübingen and bound by Buchbinderei Spinner in Ottersweier.

Printed in Germany.

For Christine Nearly fifty years later

Preface

Although I am the son of a Dutch Calvinist minister, the grandson of a Calvinist minister and the great-grandson of a Calvinist professor of theology, the last thing I ever imagined was that I would publish my collected essays in the distinguished series of the Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. I never was a theologian, a New Testament specialist or a patristic scholar, but after about fifteen years as ancient historian in Utrecht, I ended my scholarly career in the Chair of Religious Studies at Groningen. Yet the invitation by the editor, Jörg Frey, to publish my collected essays in his series was too attractive and honourable not to accept. After some deliberation, I decided to divide my essays into three volumes. The first one concentrates on Christianity in its first two centuries, the second on Greek and Roman mythology and religion, and the third on the interplay of Christianity and Judaism with the Greco-Roman world. The division is of course somewhat artificial, as all essays deal with the ancient world or its reception by modern scholars. It is therefore more a question of focus than of an always clear-cut division between the various volumes.

The invitation also enables me to reflect on my scholarly career and to say something about the essays presented in the first volume. I began my career in 1974 as a lecturer in Ancient History at the University of Utrecht. My first articles were on the social and religious history of Greek and Roman religion, and ancient myth and ritual, especially, have continued to fascinate me, as the second volume will amply document. However, at the end of the 1970s, my then colleague, Jan den Boeft, himself a patristic scholar and later Professor of Latin at the Free University, Amsterdam, proposed that we should give a course together on the Acts of the Christian martyrs. This course led to a series of articles with notes on these Acts as well as a Dutch translation of the most important ones. In these articles Jan den Boeft usually commented from a more theological and linguistic point of view, whereas I was responsible more for the social and historical aspects of these Acts. The course introduced me to a world that was new to me, but which also intrigued me. Moreover, Jan den Boeft also

¹ J. den Boeft and J.N. Bremmer, 'Notiunculae Martyrologicae I-V', VigChris 35 (1981) 43–56; 36 (1982) 383–402; 39 (1985) 110–30; 45 (1991) 105–22; 49 (1995) 146–64; 'Notiunculae Martyrologicae VI: Passio Perpetuae 2, 16 and 17', in J. Leemans (ed.), Persecution and Martyrdom in Late Antique Christianity. Essays in Honour of Boudewijn Dehandschutter (Leuven, 2010) 47–63 = this volume, Chapter 25, and Martelaren van de Oude Kerk (Kampen, 1988).

VIII Preface

introduced me to the Dutch Society for Early Christian Studies, where I made the acquaintance of two great Dutch patristic scholars, Toon Bastiaensen (1926–2009) and Gerard Bartelink, whose *Festschriften* made me think of wider problems in early Christianity.²

The earliest of these contributions, on upper-class Christian women (Ch. 3), continued an interest of mine that started to develop in the early 1980s. It was the time when second-wave feminism reached Europe from the US and women's history became popular. At first I looked only at women in ancient Greece,³ but gradually I realised that early Christianity also offered many fascinating perspectives in this respect, and this interest in women's history remains visible all through this volume. In addition to the elite women, in the first section this interest is reflected especially in the chapters on widows (Ch. 4) and prophecy (Ch. 6) and in those on the Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas (Ch. 22-26). At the same time, the study of the martyrs' Acts introduced me to other aspects of early Christian life, such as the martyrs' love of Christ, which I connect with the actual name of the Christians (Ch. 1), but which also made me think about the social and religious capital of the early Christians (Ch. 2). It is only when we come to grips with the factors that made Christianity attractive to outsiders that we can perhaps understand why the early Christians attracted so many people from outside their ranks.

The latter question, although discussed by some of the very best (church) historians in the course of the last centuries, has still not been resolved ⁴. In fact, the problem has been analysed too little because most ancient historians do not study ancient religion, let alone early Christianity. It has been one of my aims all through the book to bridge this gap between students of the Greco-Roman world and those of early Christianity by combining evidence from both areas. That is also why I looked closely at the figure of Peregrinus (Ch. 5), whose life as described by Lucian gives us an unparalleled view of Christianity through the eyes of a pagan intellectual in the later second century.⁵ We may perhaps have too little ancient information ever to understand the rise of Christianity in detail, but that is all the more reason that we should exploit all the evidence we have.

² See this volume, Chapters 1 and 3.

³ J.N. Bremmer, 'La donna anziana: libertà e indipendenza', in G. Arrigoni (ed.), *Le donne in Grecia* (Rome, 1985) 74–91, 177–82 and 'De vrouw in de Griekse wereld', in R. Stuip and C. Vellekoop (eds), *Middeleeuwers over vrouwen 2* (Utrecht, 1985) 25–36, 180–81.

⁴ For example, see my *The Rise of Christianity through the Eyes of Gibbon, Harnack and Rodney Stark* (Groningen, 2010²); from an early Christian perspective, L.W. Hurtado, *Destroyers of the Gods* (Waco, 2016).

⁵ See also my 'Lucian on Peregrinus and Alexander of Abonuteichos: A Sceptical View of Two Religious Entrepeneurs', in G. Petridou *et al.* (eds), *Beyond Priesthood* (Berlin and Boston, 2017) 47–76.

Preface IX

A new world opened up to me when I moved from Utrecht to Groningen in 1990. After the fall of the Berlin Wall and the demise of the communist regimes, the Dutch government provided funding for cooperation with universities in Eastern Europe. On the initiative of the then Head of the Department of Church History, Hans Roldanus, the Groningen theological faculty initiated links with the Károli Gáspár University of Budapest, where our main partner was the then Professor of New Testament Studies, the humane János Bolyki (1931-2011). It was decided to focus on the Apocryphal Acts of the Apostles as a genre that had been quite neglected until that time following the work at the turn of the last century by Richard Adelbert Lipsius (1830-1892) and Maximilien Bonnet (1841–1917). The choice proved to be a fortunate one. In a series of annual conferences, various aspects of all the main Apocryphal Acts as well as the, arguably, related Pseudo-Clementines, have been illuminated in a manner not done before. The advantage of this Groningen-Budapest cooperation was that it included not only Old Testament and New Testament scholars but also classicists and ancient historians. As a result, the volumes regularly contain a more varied approach to the Apocryphal Acts than many other publications in this field, which often are more interested in their relations to the canonical Scriptures.⁶

In my own contributions to these volumes (Ch. 7–16), I usually looked at the position of women, as already explained, but also at the many occurrences of magic. In the middle of the 1980s, a new interest arose in magic in the ancient world,⁷ which also caught my attention. Although the occurrence of magic in the Apocryphal Acts had not gone unnoticed,⁸ it appeared that the subject was still largely unexplored. Its study throws a light on a less noticed aspect of early Christianity, which in this respect seems to have been fairly close to its non-Christian environment. The many miracles of Jesus and the apostles must have been hard to distinguish from contemporary magic, as the efforts of the early Christians to differentiate themselves from the pagan magicians clearly show (Ch. 13). The confusion which this closeness seems to have caused lasted until the third century, when increasing acquaintance with the Christians must

⁶ For example, J.-M. Roessli and T. Nicklas (eds), Christian Apocrypha. Receptions of the New Testament in Ancient Christian Apocrypha (Göttingen, 2014). For the most recent review of the relationship between the Canonical and Apocryphal Acts, see the nuanced analysis of J. Snyder, 'Relationships between the Acts of the Apostles and Other Apostle Narratives', in J. Frey et al. (eds), Between Canonical and Apocryphal Texts: Processes of Reception, Rewriting and Interpretation in Early Judaism and Early Christianity (Tübingen, 2017), forthcoming.

⁷ For good bibliographies, see P. Brillet and A. Moreau, 'Bibliographie générale', in A. Moreau and J.-C. Turpin (eds), *La magie*, 4 vols (Montpellier, 2000) 4.7–159; J.L. Calvo Martínez, 'Cien años de investigación sobre la magia antigua', *MHNH* 1 (2001) 7–60; P. Fabrini, *Magica antiqua. Indice e guida a una bibliografía informatica* (Pisa, 2006); R. Gordon and F. Marco Simón (eds), *Magical Practice in the Latin West* (Leiden, 2010) 1–4.

⁸ G. Poupon, 'L'accusation de magie dans les Actes Apocryphes', in F. Bovon et al., Les Actes Apocryphes des Apôtres (Geneva, 1981) 71–93.

X Preface

have lessened the need to stress the difference with the pagans in this respect. The Apocryphal Acts are thus an important witness to this aspect of early Christianity, which is much less visible in other early Christian writings.

The Apocryphal Acts are also valuable testimonies to Christian life in general in the second half of the second century. They show us something of the variety of the Christian movement, which, from a theological point of view, was being kept together by family resemblances rather than by its constitution as a monolithic group. It was the centrality of Christ, the acceptance of the Old Testament as authoritative together with the, somewhat flexible, Christian ritual that were the main unifying factors. Yet within this unity there was a large 'interactive diversity', 9 as is also very noticeable in the Apocryphal Acts, which clearly reflect different theological ideas and ritual practices, but also react to one another.

For a proper view, though, of the development of early Christianity, we should be able to locate these writings in time and place, the more so given the relative rarity of second-century Christian texts. ¹⁰ In my earliest articles I took over the then current opinions, but increasing familiarity with the texts has led me to new insights. Attention to the theological themes, onomastics, social terminology and intertextuality of the Apocryphal Acts has now made me conclude that we must study them in the chronological order of *John*, *Andrew*, *Peter*, *Paul* and *Thomas* (Ch. 7–11, 14.2), noting that the first three were written in Pontus/Bithynia, the *Acts of Paul* in South West Asia Minor and the *Acts of Thomas* in Edessa. The location in Pontus/Bithynia may surprise, but the famous correspondence of Pliny with Trajan shows that Christianity was already widespread in that area at the beginning of the second century.

After the Apocryphal Acts, the Groningen/Budapest conferences turned to the early Apocryphal Apocalypses (Ch. 17–21). Here my attention was first drawn to the problem of Greek influence on the *Apocalypse of Peter*. As explained in more detail in the various relevant chapters, classicists at the beginning of the last century wanted to explain the Christian ideas about hell through the influence of Orphism, whereas Martha Himmelfarb in her excellent *Tours of Hell* (1983) stressed the Jewish background to the Apocalypses. In the course of my investigations I have gradually come to the conclusion that the historical reality was more complicated. As I now see it, in the earliest Christian Apocalypses we can observe a merging of both Jewish and Greek traditions. Moreover, even regarding the Jewish traditions, we should be aware of the fact that

⁹ L. Hurtado, 'Interactive Diversity: A Proposed Model of Christian Origins', *JThS* 64 (2013) 445–62; T. Nicklas, *Jews and Christians?* (Tübingen, 2014).

¹⁰ R. Pervo, 'Narratives about the Apostles: Non-canonical Acts and Related Literature', in A. Gregory and C. Tuckett (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Early Christian Apocrypha* (Oxford, 2015) 65–89 is unhelpful in this respect. Better: H.-J. Klauck, *The Apocryphal Acts of the Apostles: An Introduction* (Waco, 2008).

Preface XI

recent research has increasingly shown the pervasive influence of Greek in Palestine from the Seleucid period onwards. Even if Greek did not become the language for religious discourse, all educated Judeans, and even some non-elite ones, if probably to a much smaller extent, must have been proficient in Greek at the time of emerging Christianity. As the origin of the *Apocalypse of Peter*, whether Egypt or Palestine, is still debated (Ch. 18.1), it is important to realise that educated Judeans, too, had access to Greek literature.

Very early on, the Christians appropriated the Jewish genre of the tour of hell, adapted the genre to their own needs and fashions, and composed a number of such writings up to Late Antiquity. Although the oldest Apocalypses were still steeped in Jewish traditions, over time Christian influence on the genre increased. In fact, in the late fourth-century *Apocalypse of Paul* Christian sins have replaced most of the traditional Jewish ones (Ch. 19). Interestingly, we also notice that the descents of the early Apocalypses influenced a number of ascents in Gnostic writings, which were also influenced by Orphic traditions (Ch. 21.5). One of the fascinating aspects of this particular subject is the realisation of the entanglement of the various religious traditions, which previous generations of scholars often liked to keep as separate as possible.

The final section of this book focuses on the Acts of the Christian martyrs, in particular on the, undoubtedly, most interesting one, the Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas (Ch. 22-26). The Passio is a unique document, as it gives us an unparalleled insight into the mind and behaviour of a young woman who had converted to Christianity. But it also shows us something of her family circumstances as well as of the attitude of the Roman government and of her fellow Christians. It is no wonder that such a unique document has received much scrutiny in recent times. The problem with the early Acts of the Martyrs is not one of a simple choice between authenticity or forgery, but of determining to what extent these texts have used earlier Acts as intertexts, embedded the Acts in other writings or adapted them to the liturgy in which they were read. In the case of *Perpetua*, it is clear that we do not simply have a writing left by a young woman. There are indications that the editor modestly edited her 'diary', but he also influenced the reader by adding the vision of Saturus, his description of the deaths of the martyrs and by adding his own prologue and epilogue (Ch. 22.2). Yet despite the adaptation of Perpetua's text to the ideological aim of the editor and his embedding it into a new context, 12 the modest scale of the editor's textual interventions and his chronological closeness to the original death of Per-

¹¹ See now W. Ameling, 'Epigraphy and the Greek Language in Hellenistic Palestine', SCI 34 (2015) 1–18; M.O. Wise, Language and Literacy in Roman Judaea: A Study of the Bar Kokhba Documents (New Haven and London, 2015).

¹² For the editor's aims, see J. den Boeft, 'The Editor's Prime Objective: *Haec in Aedificationem Ecclesiae Legere*', in J.N. Bremmer and M. Formisano (eds), *Perpetua's Passions* (Oxford, 2012) 169–79.

XII Preface

petua and her fellow martyrs (Ch. 24.2) seem to guarantee the authenticity of the text.

In my analyses, I have tried to elucidate the visions of Perpetua and Saturus, but also visions of heaven (Ch. 27), by combining Christian motifs and the Roman *Umwelt*. It is my strong conviction that we should try to understand these visions not from pre-conceived modern ideas, like those of psychoanalysis, but from the contemporary world these martyrs were living in. At the time of writing the original version of the chapter on the motivation of the martyrs (Ch. 24), I was struck forcefully by the events of 9/11 and their aftermath. It seemed to me that we all had to reflect on the motivation of the perpetrators and try to understand, as far as that is possible, what moved them and the Palestinian suicide bombers, who were much in the news due to the Second Intifada (2000-2005). I therefore compared several aspects of their behaviour and context with that of Perpetua and her group.¹³ I further reflected on these problems in the original version of the chapter on Felicitas (Ch. 23). In the present book, I have merged and updated the two versions (Ch. 24.3). At the time of writing this Preface, the summer of 2016, Europe has been faced with a series of (suicide-)attacks by followers of ISIS, usually males with a career of petty criminality and/or an unstable mentality. They constitute a different category from those discussed in my chapter, but the need to understand remains, and that is why I have reprinted my reflections.

I would like to thank Brill (Leiden), Cambridge University Press, De Gruyter (Berlin), Hephaistos (Hamburg), Oxford University Press, Peter Lang (Berne), Routledge (London), Steiner Verlag (Stuttgart), Wolters Kluwer (Deventer) and, especially, Peeters (Leuven) for their permission to reprint the articles mentioned in the Acknowledgements. Any scholar who collects his earlier writings is faced with the problem of possible revisions and updating. It is of course impossible to completely redo one's own research of several decades. Yet I did not want to reprint views I no longer advocate. This is particularly the case regarding the place and time of the Apocryphal Acts. In some cases I have even completely re-written the original text in this respect, as in the chapter on the Acts of John (Ch. 7, Appendix). In other cases, I have simply updated the bibliography, made small corrections, removed overlaps where possible, reorganised a few sections and added more evidence, as in the discussion of the name of the Christians (Ch. 1.3) and in the chapter (16) on Apion and Anoubion, where very recently new evidence has enriched our understanding of these figures. Naturally, this could not be done in every case, but I have always tried to bring the volume up to date to 2016 in the more important issues I discuss.

¹³ The idea is not unique: see the implicit comparison in S. Weigel (ed.), *Märtyrer-Porträts* (Munich, 2007).

Preface XIII

Most of the revisions were made in the wonderful environment of the Max-Weber-Kolleg in Erfurt, where I was a fellow during the Sommersemester of 2016. I would like to thank here Jörg Rüpke for his invitation to this most stimulating institution. The final corrections and the proofs were done in the stimulating Käte Hamburger Kolleg 'Dynamics in the History of Religion between Asia and Europe' in Bochum, where I was a fellow in the academic year 2016-2017. I am most grateful to its director Volkhard Krech for inviting me. The many debts I have incurred in the course of these articles, I mention at the end of each chapter. Here I would single out Jan den Boeft, who, as already mentioned, was instrumental in introducing me to the world of early Christianity, and my Groningen colleague Ton Hilhorst, who has been a long standing critic of my articles and whose eagle eye and erudition have often saved me from mistakes. I am also grateful to Tobias Nicklas, who not only first suggested that I collect my articles but with whom I was able to resume the study of the apocryphal literature through his great hospitality in Regensburg. Last but not least, these articles would not have been written without my wife Christine, who created the ideal circumstances to work and who also often accompanied me to the many conferences that lie at the basis of this volume.¹⁴

¹⁴ I am grateful to Orla Mulholland for her correction of my English.

Contents

Pro	eface	VII
Ab	obreviations	XVII
	Section I Aspects of Early Christianity	
1.	Why Did Jesus' Followers Call Themselves 'Christians'?	3
2.	The Social and Religious Capital of the Early Christians	13
3.	Why Did Early Christianity Attract Upper-class Women?	33
4.	Pauper or Patroness: the Widow in the Early Christian Church	43
5.	Peregrinus' Christian Career	65
6.	The Domestication of Early Christian Prophecy	81
	Section II Studies in the Apocryphal Acts of the Apostles and Pseudo-Clementines	
7.	Women in the Acts of John	99
8.	Man, Magic, and Martyrdom in the Acts of Andrew	115
9.	Aspects of the Acts of Peter: Women, Magic, Place and Date	133
10.	. Magic, Martyrdom and Women's Liberation in the Acts of Paul and Thecla	149
11.	. The Acts of Thomas: Place, Date and Women	167
12.	. Conversion in the Oldest Apocryphal Acts	181
13.	. Magic in the Apocryphal Acts	197

XVI Contents

14. The <i>Apocryphal Acts:</i> Authors, Place, Time and Readership	219
15. Pseudo-Clementines: Texts, Dates, Places, Authors and Magic	235
16. Apion and Anoubion in the <i>Homilies</i>	251
Section III	
Apocalypses and Tours of Hell	
17. The Apocalypse of Peter: Greek or Jewish?	269
18. The <i>Apocalypse of Peter:</i> Place, Date and Punishments	281
19. Christian Hell: From the <i>Apocalypse of Peter</i> to the <i>Apocalypse of Paul</i>	295
20. Tours of Hell: Greek, Jewish, Roman and Early Christian	313
21. Descents to Hell and Ascents to Heaven in Apocalyptic Literature .	329
Section IV The Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas	
22. Perpetua and her Diary: Authenticity, Family and Visions	349
23. Felicitas: The Martyrdom of a Young African Woman	387
24. The Motivation of Martyrs: Perpetua and the Palestinians	403
25. Passio Perpetuae 2, 16 and 17	423
26. The Vision of Saturus in the <i>Passio Perpetuae</i>	439
27. Contextualising Heaven in Third-Century North Africa	455
Acknowledgements	469
Index of Names, Places and Passages	471

${\it Section I}$ Aspects of Early Christianity

Chapter 1

Why Did Jesus' Followers Call Themselves 'Christians'?

As a rule, ancient historians pay hardly any attention to the figure and role of Christ in the Christianisation of the Roman Empire. The neglect is not only modern: Gibbon too disregarded him in his famous analysis of the rise of Christianity. This omission has something curious about it, since studies of the rise of early Christianity might naturally have been expected to say something about the relevance of the founder of the faith to his followers. It is therefore my aim to show in this chapter (§ 1) that early Christianity had an affective relationship with Christ, (§ 2) that a proper evaluation of the position of Christ in early Christian belief is a precondition for the understanding of the meteoric rise of early Christianity and (§ 3) that this relationship played a major role in the self-designation of the early followers of Christ as 'Christians'.

1. The Importance of Christ

It is certainly true that in certain sectors of early Christian literature Christ did not figure very clearly as an identifiable human being who had been crucified on Golgotha. Second-century apologetics, which tried to make the Christian faith respectable in the eyes of educated pagans, portrayed Christ as the incarnation of the Logos – hardly a figure to be very intimate with.² And in the later second-century apocryphal *Acts of the Apostles* Jesus is not pictured as really human but as God; in these *Acts* Jesus remains 'invisible' and the apostles have taken his place as the person to imitate.³ However, a rather different picture emerges when we look at the early Christian *Acta martyrum*.⁴

¹ E. Gibbon, *The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, ed. D. Womersley, 3 vols (London, 1995) 1.446–581; R. MacMullen, *Christianizing the Roman Empire* (New Haven and London, 1984) 21; R. Lane Fox, *Pagans and Christians* (Harmondsworth, 1986) 112; K. Hopkins, *A World Full of Gods: Pagans, Jews, and Christians in the Roman Empire* (London, 1999).

² Cf. R. Grant, *Gods and the One God* (London, 1986) 105–11; J. Roldanus, 'Verdediging of verbastering? Over subversieve elementen in het vroege christendom en de ontkenning daarvan', in *De historie herzien. Vijfde bundel 'Historische avonden' uitgegeven door het Historisch genootschap te Groningen* (Hilversum, 1987) 135–64 at 148–52.

³ L. van Kampen, *Apostelverhalen* (Diss. Utrecht, 1990); Hopkins, *World Full of Gods*, 156–60. It may be asked – but space does not permit an answer – whether the martyrs' love for

We will take as our point of departure the martyrdom of Polycarp. When the Roman governor asked Polycarp to curse Christ, he answered, 'For eighty-six years I have been his slave (cf. below) and he has done me no wrong. How can I blaspheme against my king and saviour?' (Polycarp 9.3). The account of his death states, in reaction to Jewish agitation, 'little did they know that we could never abandon Christ, for it was he who suffered for the redemption of those who are saved in the entire world, the innocent one dying on behalf of sinners. Nor could we worship anyone else' (17.2); Carpus cried out when the fire was set beneath his cross, 'Lord Jesus Christ, you know that we suffer this for your name's sake' (Carpus, Papylus and Agathonice [Latin version] 5); Perpetua walked to the arena 'as a matrona of Christ' (Perpetua 18.2); Maximillian has 'the sign of Christ' and is therefore unable to accept 'the seal of the world' (Maximilian 2.4); Marcellus can only serve 'Jesus Christ, Son of God, the almighty Father' (Marcellus 2.2); Euplus has received the holy Gospels 'from my Lord Jesus Christ, the Son of God' (Euplus 1.5) and Gallonius is Christi devotus.⁵

We even find a mystical presence of Christ in some of the martyrs. When the Lyonese martyr Sanctus was cruelly tortured, 'Christ suffering in him achieved great deeds of glory' (Martyrs of Lyons 23), and when Felicitas, labouring in the pains of childbirth, was asked how she would endure the terrors of the arena, she answered, 'then there will be another one in me who will suffer for me, just as I shall be suffering for him' (Perpetua 15).6 The mystical presence may also explain the state of ecstasy which helped martyrs bear their tortures. In its account of the martyrdom of Polycarp, the Smyrnean church relates that 'some indeed attained to such courage that they would utter not a sound of a cry, showing to all of us that in the hour of their torment these witnesses of Christ were not present in the flesh, or rather that the Lord was there present holding converse with them. Fixing their eyes on the favour of Christ, they despised the tortures of this world, in one hour buying themselves an exemption from eternal fire' (Polycarp 2.2). And after Blandina was being tossed a lot by a bull, 'she no longer perceived what was happening because of the hope and possession of all she believed in and because of her intimacy with Christ' (Martyrs of Lyons 56).

and dedication to a human Christ was not an important factor in the victory of 'orthodox' Christianity over those Christians with strong docetist interests.

⁴ For the texts, editions and historical value of these *Acta*, see this volume, Chapter 22.1. I cite the *Acta* by their main protagonist(s).

⁵ P. Chiesa, 'Un testo agiografico Africano di Aquileia: Gli *Acta* di Gallonio e dei martiri di Timida Regia', *AB* 114 (1996) 241–68 at 265 (martyrdom of AD 303/4).

⁶ The presence of Christ in the martyr can also be found in Tertullian, *Pudicitia*, 22.6 and in Augustine, cf. J. den Boeft, 'Martyres sunt homines fuerunt', in A.A.R. Bastiaensen *et al.* (eds), *Fructus Centesimus. Mélanges G.J.M. Bartelink* (Steenbrugge and Dordrecht, 1989) 115–24 at 120.

These quotations demonstrate that the early Christians had an affective relationship with Christ.⁷ They also show that students of early Christianity have to be attentive to the mode of discourse in that literature. Schematically we could say, using a favourite distinction of modern French historiography, that early Christian apologetic, theological and fictional literature shows Christianity conçu, whereas the *Acta martyrum* illustrate more how it was vécu. A proper evaluation of early Christianity has to take into account both these aspects.

2. Christian and pagan adhesion to one god

Ancient historians' misjudgment of the position of Christ also precludes a proper understanding of the rise of early Christianity.⁸ Naturally we cannot here analyse the whole of this complicated issue, as a proper understanding has to account for the various ways Christianity fulfilled the religious, social, moral and intellectual needs of its time. Here I want to limit myself to some observations as to how the love for Christ fitted into the religious climate of the Roman Empire. The close relationship between Jesus and his followers is regularly characterised in Paul (Romans 1.1, Philippians 1.1, Titus 1.1),⁹ the Apostolic Fathers (1 Clement 60.2; Ignace, Magn. 2), the apocryphal Acts of the Apostles (Acta Petri 30, 41) and the Acta martyrum (Polycarp 9.3) by the term doulos, 'slave'. ¹⁰ This self-designation of Jesus' followers as his 'slaves' has its counterpart in the designation of Jesus himself as the Kyrios, the 'Master' or 'Lord', a

⁷ For the central place of Christ in the life of the early Christian martyrs, see also M. Pellegrino, Ricerche patristiche, 2 vols (Turin, 1982) 1.385–425; H. Crouzel, 'L'imitation et la "suite" de Dieu et du Christ dans les premiers siècles chrétiens ainsi que dans leurs sources gréco-romaines et hébraïques', JAC 21 (1978) 18–41; V. Saxer, Pères saints et culte chrétien dans l'Eglise des premiers siècles (Aldershot, 1994) Ch. VIII ('La professione di fede del martire negli Atti autentici dei primi tre secoli'); C. Pietri, Christiana respublica, 3 vols (Rome, 1997) 2.1229–30; H. Bakker, Exemplar Domini. Ignatius of Antioch and His Martyrological Self-Concept (Diss. Groningen, 2003) 149–57; C.R. Moss, The Other Christs (Oxford, 2010) and Ancient Christian Martyrdom (New Haven and London, 2012) 49–76. The theme remains important in the later 'passions épiques': M. Taveirne, 'Das Martyrium als imitatio Christi: Die literarische Gestaltung der spätantiken Märtyrerakten und -passionen nach der Passion Christi', ZAC 18 (2014) 167–203. In general: L.W. Hurtado, Lord Jesus Christ: Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity (Grand Rapids, 2003).

⁸ R. Stark, *The Rise of Christianity* (Princeton, 1996); Hopkins, *World full of Gods*; J.N. Bremmer, *The Rise of Christianity through the Eyes of Gibbon, Harnack and Rodney Stark* (Groningen, 2010²).

⁹ See also K.H. Rengstorf, 'doulos etc.', in TWNT, 2.264-83 at 276-80; D. Martin, Slavery as Salvation (New Haven and London, 1990) 50-85; G. Theissen, Social Reality and the Early Christians (Minneapolis, 1992) 187-201.

¹⁰ For the later, very normal, usage, note P.J. Sijpesteijn, 'Apphus and Pascentius: servi dei tempore', Archiv für Papyrusforschung 40 (1994) 69–70; R. Haensch, 'Bescheidenheit ist eine Zier: Der Gebrauch der Demutsformel δοῦλος θεοῦ in den Kirchenbauinschriften der spätantiken Patriarchate Antiochia und Jerusalem', in A.B. Kuhn (ed.), Social Status and Prestige in

title occurring more than 180 times in the New Testament. 11 A.D. Nock (1902– 1963), like W. Bousset (1866-1920) and A. Deissmann (1866-1937) before him, rightly connected this title of Christ with a development in Hellenistic piety, in which gods are represented as absolute rulers and addressed by such titles as Kyrios, Despotês and Tyrannos. According to Nock, in Christianity the title Kyrios 'implies a belief in the divine overruling of the individual, who receives commands from on high.' This is certainly too one-sided a view, as Nock paid insufficient attention to the correlation between the title Kyrios and the self-designation of the faithful as slaves of god so-and-so. It is this self-designation, which has been studied in an important contribution by my compatriot Pleket, who has demonstrated that even before the Hellenistic-Roman period we can find traces of a close affective relationship between deity and worshipper. This dependency was strengthened and disseminated in the Hellenistic-Roman period, as he argued, under oriental influence and in connection with the rise of autocratic political systems. Like Nock before him, Pleket noted that 'these elements acted as a sort of praeparatio evangelica for the common man whose head was not crammed with theological dogma, and facilitated the transition to a structurally subservient religion (Christianity)'.12

The shift from polytheism to adhesion to one god first manifested itself in the so-called oriental cults of the later classical era, but in the Roman period its spirit also pervaded established pagan religion. However, in early Christianity this adhesion to only one god seems to have assumed more intense forms than in competing, pagan cults. Consequently, a neglect of Christ overlooks an important aspect of early Christianity.

the Graeco-Roman World (Stuttgart, 2015) 315–39. For the Old Testament background of the Christian usage, see J.P. Floss, Jahweh dienen – Götter dienen (Cologne, 1975).

¹¹ E. Bickerman, *Studies in Jewish and Christian Religion*, 3 vols (Leiden, 1976–86) 3.148–9 wrongly derives the terminology from Persia where the word 'slave' was used to denote high officers of the king, cf. G. Widengren, *Der Feudalismus im alten Iran* (Cologne, 1969) 21–34.

¹² A.D. Nock, *Essays on Religion and the Ancient World*, ed. Z. Stewart, 2 vols (Oxford, 1972) 1.77; H.W. Pleket, 'Religious history as the history of mentality: the "believer" as servant of the deity in the Greek world', in H.S. Versnel (ed.), *Faith, Hope and Worship* (Leiden, 1981) 152–92.

^{13'} Pleket, 'Religious history'; P. Veyne, 'Une évolution du paganisme gréco-romain: injustice et piété des dieux, leurs ordres ou "oracles"; *Latomus* 45 (1986) 259–83, repr. in his *La société romaine* (Paris, 1991) 281–310; H.S. Versnel, *Ter Unus* (Leiden, 1990) 88–94.

¹⁴ Cf. A. Hilhorst, "Servir Dieu" dans la terminologie du judaïsme hellénistique et des premières générations chrétiennes de langue grecque', in Bastiaensen *et al.*, *Fructus Centesimus*, 177–92.

3. Jesus' followers as 'Christians'

An additional argument for the importance of Christ can be found in the name 'Christian', since the early Christians not infrequently connected their name with Christ. For example, in his *Scorpiace* (9.8–9) Tertullian observes that whoever confesses to be a Christian also testifies to belonging to Christ (*Christi se esse*), and a similar connection between 'Christian' and 'Christ' occurs in the Greek version of *Carpus, Papylus and Agathonice* (5). The connection looks only natural to us: surely, the followers of Christ called themselves 'Christians'! Yet this was not the case in early Christianity. Other names, such as 'the Way', ¹⁵ 'the believers', 'the saints' or 'God's people' were more popular in the first two centuries. ¹⁶

The term 'Christian' is still absent from Paul, 1 Clement and Tatian, and it is rare in Irenaeus and Hippolytus. Aristides, Ignatius and Athenagoras even speak of the 'so-called Christians'. Which factor(s), then, helped to get the name established? Various solutions have been proposed, of which that of Adolf von Harnack (1851–1930) has been the most influential: 'er (i.e. the name 'Christian') allein war gegen jede Verwechslung geschützt'. However, his very practical solution takes insufficient account of the fact that at one particular occasion the utterance of the name 'Christian' was not only normal but virtually obligatory.

Before studying this occasion, we will first look at the origin of the term 'Christian'. In the canonical Acts, Luke relates that 'it was in Antioch that the disciples were called Christians for the first time' (11.26: χρηματίσαι τε πρώτως ἐν Ἀντιοχεία τοὺς μαθητὰς Χριστιανούς). This is the usual translation, but Elias Bickerman (1897–1981) argued that the Greek usage of χρηματίζω obliges us to accept a translation which has these followers style themselves Christians.¹⁹

¹⁵ E.R. Urciuoli, "Quella ὁδός che essi chiamano αἵρεσις". Alle origini dell'autocomprensione filosofica dei seguaci di Gesù', ASE 28 (2011) 117–36.

¹⁶ Cf. A. von Harnack, Die Mission und Ausbreitung des Christentums in den ersten drei Jahrhunderten (Leipzig, 1924³) 410–45; H. Karpp, 'Christennamen', in RAC 2 (1954) 1114–38; K.H. Kritzer, Selbstbezeichnungen der Christen in der frühchristl. nichtbibl. Literatur des I. und II. Jhrdts. (Diss. Salzburg, 1970: non vidi); A. Ferrua, Scritti vari di epigrafe e antichità cristiane (Bari, 1991) 12–25 (on the spelling of Christianus/-os, first published in 1933); T. Hegedus, 'Naming Christians in Antiquity', Studies in Religion 32 (2004) 173–90; A. Luijendijk, Greetings in the Lord (Cambridge MA, 2008) 38–40; P. Trebilco, Self-Designations and Group Identity in the New Testament (Cambridge, 2012); M. Bile and B. Gain, 'Une nouvelle étymologie de χριστιανός?', RÉAug 58 (2012) 141–53, D.G. Horrell, Becoming Christian (London, 2013) 164–210 ('The Label Christianoi: 1 Pet 4.16 and the Formation of Christian Identity', first published in 2007).

¹⁷ Aristides 15; Ign. Magn. 4, Rom. 3; Athen. Leg. 1.3.

¹⁸ Harnack, *Mission*, 428, who is followed by Karpp, 'Christennamen', 1134, although also noting the connection of the name with Christ.

¹⁹ Bickerman, Studies, 3.96–9, largely accepted by E. Peterson, Frühkirche, Judentum und Gnosis (Freiburg, 1959) 64–87; C. Spicq, 'Ce que signifie le titre du chrétien?', Studia Theolo-

Moreover, he sees in the choice of the word 'Christian' the wish of the Christians to avoid the term doulos, 'slave', as it would sound too much like the terminology of oriental gods. Instead, so Bickerman claims, they styled themselves Christiani as, 'agents, representatives of the Messiah'. Both these views of Bickerman are unpersuasive. Firstly, recent studies of the verb have established that the verb means 'a person carries a particular name, title, ethnic officially and in public'. 20 Thus the passage in Acts tells us that in Antioch the disciples were first called Christians in public, perhaps (officially) by the Roman authorities. We may add that it would indeed be hard to understand why it took so long for 'Christians' to become the accepted self-designation of the early followers of Christ, if the followers themselves had coined the term. Secondly, Bickerman's translation of 'Christian' will hardly do. From comparable early word formations - Caesariani ('Caesar's army'), ²¹ Pompeiani (Pompey's followers'), ²² Pisoniani ('Piso's soldiers'), 23 Ciceroniani ('friend/cliens of Cicero'), 24 Herodiani ('followers of Herodes'), 25 Augustiani ('Nero's claque') 26 and Galbiani (Galba's troops')²⁷ – we can see that at the narrated time of Acts the meaning of 'Christian' can hardly have been understood otherwise than as 'follower of Christ'. Moreover, various passages in the New Testament show that early Christians called themselves 'slaves of Christ' (§ 2). We really have no sufficient information to solve the problem definitively, but Peterson's hypothesis that Jesus' followers received their designation from the Roman authorities at least explains the fact that the Jewish-Hellenistic followers of Christ eventually adopted a Roman word-formation.²⁸

If the precise origin of the term 'Christian' is still debated, we can perhaps be more certain about the way the name became the accepted self-designation of

gica 15 (1961) 68–78; T. Barnes, Early Christian Hagiography and Roman History = Tria Corda 5 (Tübingen, 2010) 2; B. Shaw, 'The Myth of the Neronian Persecution', JRS (2015) 73–100 at 80.

²⁰ C.P. Jones, 'Epigraphica [I-III]', *ZPE* 139 (2002) 108–16; Y. Broux *et al.*, 'ώς χρηματίζει and the Importance of Naming in Roman Egypt', *ZPE* 174 (2010) 159–66 at 164 (quotation).

²¹ 'Hirtius', Bell. Alex. 13.1, Bell. Afr. 14.3, 24.3, 59.1, Bell. Hisp. 34.1; Senatus consultum de Cnaeo Pisone patre 55 of AD 20, cf. W. Eck et al., Das senatus consultum de Cn. Pisone patre (Munich, 1996) 175–7.

²² 'Hirtius', Bell. Alex. 59, Bell. Hisp. 34.1.

²³ Senatus consultum de Cnaeo Pisone patre 55, cf. Eck, Das senatus consultum de Cn. Pisone patre, 175–7.

²⁴ Sen. Contr. 7.2.12: Buteo hoc colore: 'vocetur' inquit 'ille Ciceronianus [ille] cliens, amicus'.

²⁵ Mark 3.6, 12.13, cf. Bickerman, Studies, 3.22–33 ('Les Hérodiens', first published in 1938), improved upon by H.H. Rowley, 'The Herodians in the Gospels', JThS 41 (1940) 14–27; most recently, G. Ringshausen, 'Das Rätsel der Ἡρφδιανοί im Markusevangelium', ZNW 106 (2015) 115–25.

²⁶ Tac. Ann. 14.15.5; Suet. Nero 25.

²⁷ Tac. Hist. 1.51.3.

²⁸ Peterson, Frühkirche, 78.

the followers of Jesus. Once again, we take our point of departure in a passage from the *Martyrdom of Polycarp*. After the proconsul had insisted that Polycarp should swear by the emperor's Genius, the bishop answered, 'If you delude yourself into thinking that I will swear by the emperor's Genius, as you say, and if you pretend not to know who I am, listen and I will tell you plainly: "I am a Christian" (10: Χριστιανός είμι). This straightforward statement did not deter the proconsul from continuing his attempts to persuade, but finally he sent his herald to the centre of the arena to announce, 'Three times Polycarp has confessed that he is a Christian' (12).²⁹

Evidently, this was the essential information which had been gathered in the course of the interrogation and it firmly established Polycarp's guilt. In its direct or indirect form, this formula of 'I am a Christian' occurs in virtually all the *Acta* that have been recognised as authentic; it is only lacking in the reports of the martyrdoms of *Montanus and Lucius* and of *Felix*. Usually, the confession is placed right at the beginning of the proceedings, but in some cases the declamation is the climax of the hearing, following the refusal to participate in pagan ritual.³⁰ The Christians even volunteered this confession without being asked, as *Euplus* well illustrates: 'In the consulship of our lords Diocletian (for the ninth time) and Maximian (for the eighth time) on the 29th of April (304), in the most famous city of Catana, in the court room, in front of the curtain, Euplus shouted out: "I wish to die, for I am a Christian" (1).

The statement 'I am a Christian' clearly is the answer to the simple question 'Are you a Christian?'. This question enabled the Roman magistrates to minimise the rather embarrassing situation that they were trying people who were not really guilty of any obvious crimes. As the Christian Lucius said to the urban prefect Urbicus after he had ordered Ptolemaeus to be executed: 'What is the charge? He has not been convicted of adultery, fornication, murder, clothes-stealing, robbery, or of any crime whatsoever; yet you have punished this man because he confesses the name of Christian' (*Ptolemaeus and Lucius*

²⁹ This translation follows a punctuation which differs from the traditional one, cf. J. den Boeft and J.N. Bremmer, 'Notiunculae Martyrologicae III', *VigChris* 39 (1985) 110–30 at 111–3, accepted in the new edition by O. Zwierlein, *Die Urfassungen der Martyria Polycarpi et Pionii und das Corpus Polycarpianum*, 2 vols (Berlin and Boston, 2014).

³⁰ Direct: Polycarp 10; Justin 3.4, 4 passim; Lyons 19–20, 50; Scillitani 9–10, 13; Apollonius 2; Perpetua 3.2, 6.4; Carpus 3.5, 23, 34; Pionius 8.2 and 4, 9.5 and 7, 15.7, 16.2, 18.6; Cyprian 1.2; Fructuosus 2.3; Maximilian 1.2–3, 2.6 and 9; Julius 1.3; Agape 3.2 and 7; Euplus 1.1; P. Maraval, La passion inédite de S. Athénogène de Pédachthoé en Cappadoce (BHG 197b) (Brussels, 1990) 75 (martyrdom under Diocletian); Chiesa, 'Un testo agiografico', 265 (martyrdom of Gallonius); A. Pietersma, The Acts of Phileas, Bishop of Thmuis (Geneva, 1984) 107 (ca. AD 306: Latin version). Indirect: Ptolemaeus and Lucius 11, 16; Lyons 10, 26, 50; Potamiaena and Basilides 5; Marianus 4.9, 5.2; Marinus 3; Marcellus 2.1; Abitinian Martyrs 5, 10, 13–18; P. van Minnen, 'The Earliest Account of a Martyrdom in Coptic', AB 113 (1995) 13–38 (a martyrdom of AD 305). Climax: Scillitani 9; Justin 3.4.

³¹ Cf. Pliny, Ep. 10.96.2: interrogavi ipsos an essent Christiani; Ptolemaeus and Lucius 10.

15–16). The magistrates' embarrassment with the situation clearly appears from their hesitation in putting martyrs to death. In order to reach their goal, which was apostasy and not destruction, they offered the martyrs delays ranging from three hours to three months.³²

The magistrates' embarrassment is shared by many a modern ancient historian. Why, indeed, were the Christians persecuted? In the best modern analysis of the problem, Geoffrey de Ste Croix (1910-2000) summarised his views on the reasons for the condemnation of the Christians by quoting with approval the following words of E.G. Hardy (1852-1925): 'The Christians subsequently to, as before [my italics], the rescript of Trajan were punished generally for the name, i.e. [...] for the inherent disloyalty to the state involved in their atheotês [atheism], and manifested in the obstinatio with which they clung to it.' It must be stressed that these reasons are hard to find in early reports of martyrs' processes, and Peter Brunt (1917-2005) therefore rightly questioned the validity of this view for the second century. As he observes, it leaves unexplained why Trajan did not order the tracking down of these elements so dangerous to the state: all he did was to require that the Christians sacrificed to the gods. 33 This approach was indeed slavishly followed by all Roman magistrates whose behaviour we can observe in the earliest Acta martyrum. By making sure of the fact that the persons in front of them were guilty of being Christian, they could cut short the unpleasant task of interrogating and torturing civilised people.³⁴ Lane Fox has well noted that this conclusion risks 'becoming circular, as if Christians were persecuted because they were Christian.' His own solution is that with the

³² For examples, see J. den Boeft and J.N. Bremmer, 'Notiunculae Martyrologicae', Vig-Chris 35 (1981) 43–56 at 47–8; add the Coptic martyrdom of Coluthus in E.A. Reymond and J.W. Barns, Four Martyrdoms from the Pierpont Morgan Coptic Codices (Oxford, 1973) 146.

³³ G.E.M. de Ste Croix, Christian Persecution, Martyrdom, and Orthodoxy (Oxford, 2006) 151–52 (first published in 1974); P. Brunt, 'Marcus Aurelius and the Christians', in C. Déroux (ed.), Studies in Latin Literature and Roman History I (Brussels, 1979) 483–520. For the problem, see also P. Jobert, 'Les preuves dans les procès contre les chrétiens (Ier – IVe siècles)', Revue Historique 54 (1976) 295–320; J. Walsh and G. Gottlieb, 'Zur Christenfrage im zweiten Jahrhundert', in G. Gottlieb and P. Barceló (eds), Christen und Heiden in Staat und Gesellschaft des zweiten bis vierten Jahrhunderts (Munich, 1992) 3–86; F. Vittinghoff, Civitas Romana, ed. W. Eck (Stuttgart, 1994) 322–47 ("Christianus sum" – das "Verbrechen" von Aussenseitern der römischen Gesellschaft', first published in 1984).

³⁴ Brunt, 'Marcus Aurelius', 515, states that the early Christians 'must have appeared pretty worthless to pagans of high rank and education'. It is highly doubtful, though, that many 'lower-class' Christians appeared in front of the magistrates: Justin was a philosopher, Polycarp and Cyprian were clearly wealthy, and Carpus and Dioskoros (*P.Oxy.* 50.3429) were members of the *boulê*. In fact, a number of Christians were probably 'middle-class', cf. T. Schleich, 'Missionsgeschichte und Sozialstruktur des vorkonstantinischen Christentums. Die These von der Unterschichtreligion', *Geschichte, Wissenschaft und Unterricht* 33 (1982) 269–96; W.A. Meeks, *The First Urban Christians* (New Haven and London, 1983) 51–73; H.W. Pleket, *VigChris* 39 (1985) 192–6; G.H.R. Horsley, *New Documents Illustrating Early Christianity* V (North Ryde, 1989) 111; especially, A. Weiss, *Soziale Elite und Christentum. Studien zu ordo-Angehörigen unter den frühen Christen* (Berlin and Boston, 2015).

conviction of Paul, 'The Emperor's justice had distinguished Christians from Jews, a point which was not lost on senators, the provincial governors of the future.' This may be doubted. Would the Roman elite have had any interest in the execution of a Jew of modest status?³⁵

However this may be, it is in any case certain that the only occasion when the followers of Jesus publicly used the self-designation 'Christian' was in confrontation with Roman magistrates. The inference seems therefore justified that the affirmative response 'I am a Christian' to the question of the Roman magistrates 'Are you a Christian?' became the main factor in the self-designation of Jesus' followers as 'Christians'. ³⁶ The importance of the persecutions in promoting the name 'Christian' seems to be confirmed by the non-literary evidence. In papyri, the term first appears in the earlier third century, becomes more popular only after AD 250 and is still rare as a self-identification in the fourth century. ³⁷ This is also the case with inscriptions, ³⁸ in which, perhaps not surprisingly, the term first turns up in Phrygia, an area where the difference in religiosity between pagans, Christians and Jews was much less pronounced than elsewhere in the Roman Empire. Surely, these dates can hardly be separated from the empire-wide persecution of Decius. ³⁹ It was only now that the term 'Christian'

³⁵ Lane Fox, Pagans and Christians, 428.

³⁶ Peterson, *Frühkirche*, 86, makes the same observation without noticing the central place of the formula 'I am a Christian' in the martyrs' processes.

³⁷ Papyri: SB 16.12497, cf. P. van Minnen, The Roots of Egyptian Christianity', Archiv für Papyrusforschung 40 (1994) 71–85 at 74–7 (early third century but before AD 256); P.Oxy. 42.3035 (AD 256); P.Oxy. 43.3119 (AD 259–260?); SB 12.10772 (later third century?); E.A. Judge and S.R. Pickering, 'Papyrus Documentation of Church and Community in Egypt to the Mid-Fourth Century', JAC 20 (1977) 47–71 at 66–9; O. Montevecchi, Bibbia e papiri. Luce dai papiri sulla bibbia greca (Barcelona, 1999) 155–72; Luijendijk, Greetings in the Lord, 38–40. Rarity of the term: M. Choat, Belief and Cult in Fourth-Century Papyri (Turnhout, 2006) 47.

³⁸ SEG 58.1538 (AD 150-250); MAMA XI.164 (second or third century AD); MAMA XI.95 (ca. AD 200-225); TAM V.3.1840 (AD 229/230); W. Tabbernee, Montanist Inscriptions and Testimonia (Macon, 1997) nos. 9 (ca. AD 210, but E. Gibson, The "Christians for Christians" inscriptions of Phrygia [Missoula, 1978] 98, 107 suggests the fourth century), 10 (dated to before AD 212, but the absence of Aurelia/us is no absolute guarantee of a pre-212 date), 17 (AD 243), 19 (ca. AD 230); MAMA XI.122 (AD 253/4); for further epigraphical evidence, see Tabbernee, passim; M. Guarducci, Epigrafia Graeca, 4 vols (Rome, 1967-78) 4.433-34; Pietri, Christiana respublica, 3.1583-1602. On the spelling: Tabbernee, Montanist Inscriptions, 89f.

³⁹ On Decius' persecution, see, most recently, R. Selinger, *Die Religionspolitik des Kaisers Decius: Anatomie einer Christenverfolgung* (Frankfurt/M, 1994); J.B. Rives, 'The Decree of Decius and the Religion of Empire', *JRS* 89 (1999) 135–54; B. Bleckmann, 'Zu den Motiven der Christenverfolgung des Decius', in K.-P. Johne *et al.* (eds), *Deleto paene imperio Romano. Transformationsprozesse des Römischen Reiches im 3. Jahrhundert und ihre Rezeption in der Neuzeit* (Stuttgart, 2006) 57–71; W.G. Claytor, 'A Decian *Libellus* at Luther College (Iowa)', *Tyche* 30 (2015) 13–18; S. Corcoran, 'From Unholy Madness to Right-mindedness: or how to Legislate for Religious Conformity from Decius to Justinian', in A. Papaconstantinou *et al.* (eds), *Conversion in Late Antiquity: Christianity, Islam, and Beyond* (Farnham and Burlington, 2015) 67–94; P. Schubert, 'On the Form and Content of the Certificates of Pagan Sacrifice', *JRS* 106 (2016) 1–27.

would come to everybody's attention and would be adopted by the followers of Jesus in defiance of the Roman government. What may have originated as a term of derision, now became a term of honour, legitimised by the blood of those women and men who preferred to die for their faith instead of sacrificing to the Roman emperor.⁴⁰

 $^{^{\}rm 40}\,$ I would like to thank Ton Hilhorst, Peter van Minnen and Eric Rebillard for their comments on the various versions of my text and Orla Mulholland for her skilful correction of my English.

Chapter 2

The Social and Religious Capital of the Early Christians

It was around 1980 that Pierre Bourdieu (1930–2002) launched the terms cultural and social capital in two small articles in his own journal, the Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales. Due to the limited number of Francophones in the Anglo-Saxon and Germanic worlds, he soon expanded upon these initial efforts in a much more detailed article that appeared first in German (1983) and subsequently in English (1986), his well-known 'The Forms of Capital'. Yet it was not this article that popularised the notion of social capital in the wider world, but the Harvard political scientist Robert Putnam. He really started the ball rolling, after an initial boost through the work of the sociologist James Coleman (1926–1995),³ through his 1995 article with the catchy title 'Bowling alone', which proved to be of enormous influence.4 Its impact can easily be gauged from the fact that on May 9, 2006 a Google search of 'social capital' scored around 9.090.000 and 'Robert Putnam' 342.000 hits, which is considerable, although still a lot less than Germany's most famous sociologist, the late Niklas Luhmann (1927–1998), who scored 1.560.000 hits.⁵ In fact, there are now several websites devoted to the notion of social capital with bibliographies and detailing fields where it might be of use.6

This popularity does not mean that the notion itself can be defined in a crystal-clear manner. A page on – take note – the World Bank website defined it as

¹ P. Bourdieu, 'Les trois états du capital culturel', *Actes de la Recherche en Sciences Sociales* 30 (1979) 3–6 and 'Le capital social', *ibid.* 31 (1980) 2–3

² P. Bourdieu, 'Ökonomisches Kapital, kulturelles Kapital, soziales Kapital', in R. Kreckel (ed.), Soziale Ungleichheiten (Göttingen, 1983) 183–98, translated as 'The Forms of Capital', in J.G. Richardson (ed.), Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education (New York, 1986) 241–58.

³ J.S. Coleman, 'Social Capital in the Creation of Human Capital', *American Journal of Sociology*, Suppl. 94 (1988) 95–120 and *Foundations of Social Theory* (Cambridge MA, 1990) 300–21 ('Social Capital').

⁴ R. Putnam, 'Bowling Alone: America's Declining Social Capital', *Journal of Democracy* 6 (1995) 65–78; see also his 'The Prosperous Community: Social Capital and Public Life', *American Prospect* 13 (1993) 35–42; 'The Strange Disappearance of Civic America', *ibid.* 24 (1996) 34–48; *Bowling Alone. The Collapse and Revival of American Community* (New York, 2000) and (ed.), *Democracies in Flux: The Evolution of Social Capital in Contemporary Society* (New York, 2002).

⁵ To put these numbers in perspective, note that Pierre Bourdieu had about 1.980.000 hits at that date.

⁶ See Wikipedia s.v.

follows: 'Social capital refers to the norms and networks that enable collective action. Increasing evidence shows that social cohesion – social capital – is critical for poverty alleviation and sustainable human and economic development'. This definition does not mention religious organisations, but Francis Fukayama, in a 1999 paper prepared for a – note again – IMF conference, interprets the notion as follows: 'social capital is an instantiated informal norm that promotes cooperation between two or more individuals. The norms that constitute social capital can range from a norm of reciprocity between two friends, all the way up to complex and elaborately articulated doctrines like Christianity or Confucianism'. 8

It is clear from these and other definitions, which could be multiplied many times over, that leading modern institutions, such as the IMF and the World Bank, see 'social capital' primarily as a notion to apply to society as a whole in order to promote social cohesion. Yet such quotations only show the applications of the notion at the present moment. However, for a better understanding we should also look at the applicability of the notion to the past. That is what I want to do in my own contribution. I have chosen to discuss briefly the social capital of the early Christians, even though at least some of them did not want to be part of society as a whole. On the contrary, quite a few early Christians saw themselves as strangers in this world and were perceived as such by their contemporaries. 9 As Caecilius reproaches Minucius Felix in the early third-century Octavius: 'You do not go to our shows, you take no part in our processions, you are not present at our public banquets, you shrink in horror from our sacred games' (12.5, tr. G.W. Clarke). In other words, many early Christians completely shied away from ancient civic life. Current American ideas, then, clearly do not apply to them, the less so as the early Christians did not move in the public sphere as such. However, that did not mean that Christian congregations lacked social capital for their members. In fact, I would like to mention four kinds of social capital that are relevant to the rise of the Christian church from a small Jewish sect to the dominating religion of the Roman Empire.

Before I proceed with that discussion, let me first note that it may perhaps cause surprise to find the early Christian churches in a volume dedicated to ancient 'associations' (*thiasoi* or *collegia*). However, Pliny already talked about them as a *hetaeria* in a letter to Trajan, and Tertullian (*Apol.* 38–9) used a wide spectrum of terms such as *factio*, *coetus* and *congregatio* to denote the associa-

⁷ The original page has disappeared, but the definition can be easily found by googling.

⁸ www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/seminar/1999/reforms/fukuyama.htm#I (accessed 7-1-2017).

⁹ R. Feldmeier, *Die Christen als Fremde* (Tübingen, 1992) 105–32.

¹⁰ This chapter originally appeared in an issue of *Hephaistos* dedicated to associations.

¹¹ Pliny, Ep. 10.96.7, cf. C. Marek, Pontus et Bithynia. Die römischen Provinzen im Norden Kleinasiens (Mainz, 2003) 117–25. Note that Philo, Hypothetica 5, uses the term for the Essenes.

tion character of early Christianity. 12 It is perhaps this character as an association that made Lucian describe Peregrinus as a thiasarchês, 'head of a thiasos' in his De morte Peregrini (11);¹³ similarly, Celsus speaks of the Christians as thiasôtai (Origen, CC 3.23). Lucian's description has been criticised as being wholly wrong, 14 but the term thiasos was widely used to denote a religious association and certainly not limited to the Dionysiac ones; in fact, thiasoi of Jews, 15 of Heracles, ¹⁶ of the Mater Oureia (SEG 41.1329A.4), of the Agathodaimôn (SEG 48.1120), of Hekate (SEG 57.779), of the Theos Hypsistos (CIRB 1259) and of the followers of Sarapis (SEG 55.1463bis) are well attested. ¹⁷ Lucian probably adapted his description to what he knew of Judaism, Christianity and the cult of the Theos Hypsistos, cults that, initially at least, clearly showed strongly overlapping features. His only partial knowledge of Christianity also appears from the fact that he presents Peregrinus as a *prostatês*, a patron. This title too occurs in several Jewish communities, 18 but it is not attested for males in early Christian congregations. 19 Given these pagan interpretations, several scholars at the turn of the twentieth century, in particular Georg Heinrici (1844-1915) and Edwin Hatch (1835–1889), already concluded that the early Christian congregations could be seen, from one point of view, as a religious association.²⁰ This point of view has be become more popular in recent times, ²¹ and can certainly

¹² Also note K. Zamfir, 'The Community of the Pastoral Epistles – a Religious Association', in V. Gabrielsen and C.A. Thomsen (eds), *Private Associations and the Public Sphere* (Copenhagen, 2015) 206–40.

¹³ For Peregrinus, see this volume, Chapter 5.

¹⁴ H.D. Betz, 'Lukian von Samosata und das Christentum', *Novum Test.* 3 (1959) 226–37 (reprinted with "Nachtrag" in his *Hellenismus und Urchristentum*, Tübingen, 1990, 10–21) at 229–30; C.P. Jones, *Culture and Society in Lucian* (Cambridge MA, 1986) 122.

¹⁵ Cf. J. Scheid, 'Communauté et communauté. Réflexions sur quelques ambiguïtés d'après l'exemple des thiases de l'Égypte romaine', in N. Belayche and S. Mimouni (eds), Les communautés religieuses dans le monde gréco-romain (Turnhout, 2003) 61–74 at 66 note 31; add Corpus inscriptionum regni Bosporani [= CIRB] 1260–1, 1277–87, 1289; Philo, Probus 85 (Essenes); M.-O. Goulet-Cazé, Cynisme et christianisme dans l'Antiquité (Paris, 2014) 199.

¹⁶ IG II² 2345; SEG 51.224; S.D. Lambert, 'Thiasoi of Heracles and the Salaminioi', ZPE 125 (1999) 93-130.

¹⁷ For its use in Christianity, see G.J.M. Bartelink, 'Thiasos and thiasôtês chez les auteurs chrétiens', Or. Christ. Per. 45 (1979) 267–78.

¹⁸ W. Ameling, *Inscriptiones Iudaicae Orientis II, Kleinasien* (Tübingen, 2004) 93; M.H. Williams, *Jews in a Greco-Roman environment* (Tübingen, 2013) 127, 132.

¹⁹ But note Phoebe in Paul's Letter to the Romans 16.2.

²⁰ C.F. Heinrici: 'Die Christengemeinde Korinths und die religiösen Genossenschaften der Griechen', ZWT 19 (1876) 464–526; 'Zur Geschichte der Anfänge paulinischer Gemeinden', ibid. 20 (1877) 89–130; 'Zum genossenschaftlichen Charakter der paulinischen Christengemeinden', Theologische Studien und Kritiken 54 (1881) 505–24. E. Hatch: The Organization of the Early Christian Churches: Eight Lectures Delivered Before the University of Oxford in the Year 1880 (London, 1881), cf. J. Kloppenborg, 'Edwin Hatch, Churches and Collegia', in B.H. Maclean (ed.), Origins and Method: Towards a New Understanding of Judaism and Christianity (Sheffield, 1993) 212–38.

²¹ J. Kloppenborg and S. Wilson (eds), Voluntary Associations in the Graeco-Roman World

Index of names, places and passages

5 9 7 23, 38 10 and 13–18 9 15 24 17 23 18 24 acclamations 185, 385 - deus/theos 140 - heis kai monos 153, 162, 185 - magnus 128, 208 - salvator/sôter 140 - Victoria 385 Achilles Tatius 118 - and Acts of Andrew 228 - Acts of Thomas 170, 228, 242 - and Bardaisan 227–28, 242 - date of 152 - and Heliodorus 227 - 2.2.4–6 152 2.9 139 3.23 141	Acts of Andrew - and Achilles Tatius 228 - and Acts of John 114, 119 - and Acts of Thomas 170 - Aegeates 120–21, 175 - author of 116 - bedrooms 175 - civic values 117 - date 119, 222 - ethical vocabulary 117–18 - and Gregory of Tours 115, 119 - Latin translation 224 - males 120 - martyrdom 129–31 - Maximilla 115, 117, 120, 175 - and military service 119 - Nicomedia 114 - and Patras 116 - place of composition 115–16 - readership 122 - self-control 186 - Stratocles 120–21, 130 - Varianus (name) 129 - AA - 2 120, 125, 204 - 3 38, 126, 205 - 3 35, 127, 141, 206 - 4 116, 129 - 5 126–28, 134, 205, 207 - 8 120, 13 - 120, 175 - 15 116, 175 - 18 120 - 36 120
- transcripts 351, 391	36 120 43 120

^{*} The *Acta martyrum* are quoted by the name of their protagonist(s) or cities. I mention only the names of modern scholars in the main text and concentrate on the most important pagan and patristic passages.

45 46 51 60 – <i>AAco</i>	130 120, 130 130 130		sition 112–14 184
9 10	119, 126, 129, 205 123–24, 199	theatre 184widows 107–0)9
14	127–28, 207	- women 99-11	
- AALat	,	- and Xenophon	of Ephesus 111
3	115	- 2.23	105
4	121	4.48	105
5	116, 125, 127–28, 203,	6.14-15	105
	206-07	12.9 and 18	105
7	125-26, 128, 205, 208	19–29	100-02
9	119	19	182
11	118, 199	20	182
13	129, 208	21	182
14	126, 205	23	183
17	205	24	173, 213
18	128–30, 207, 217	25	183
19	173	27	185
22	116–17, 121, 125, 204	30	49, 112
23	116–17, 122, 125–26,	30–36	40, 50
	203-05	31	102, 110, 112
24	120, 125, 128, 208	37–47	184
25	116	42 and 44	185
27	125–27, 203–06	46	26, 185
28	122	47	173, 185, 213
29	116, 126–27, 205	48	229
29	204, 206	48–55	110
30	120	54	186
34	116, 126–27, 204, 206	56	112, 201
Mart. pr.3–4	120 217	57 59	207 102
6	129, 217 128	63	102, 186
	120	63-86	102, 180
Acts of John	1 444 440	63-65	186
- and Acts of An		70	186
- and Acts of Pe		70–71	229
- and Acts of Th		71–74	187
- and Chariton	*	73	112
- conversion 182–87		79–80	187
- date 111-2, 222		82–83	173, 213
- and Ephesus 100–01		86	187
female readership 109–10Latin translation 224		87–105	112
and liberation		87	184
 and Manichae 		88-93	184
- and novel 22		94-102	184
2114 110 (01 22	•	106-10	26

Acts of Paul - and Acts of Pete - and Acts of Tho		Tryphaena 114,230, 237, 375widow 213	, 145, 154, 160–62, 191,
- composition 1	63	- wineless Euchari	st 152
- conversion 93		- and women 160), 179
- date 163, 222-	23	- 1	179
- Latin translation		3	150-51
- and Luke's Acts		5–7	26
- and novel 229		7	23, 179, 191
- and Physiologus		8	153
 place of compos 		9	152–53, 191
- widows 192	1001 100	11	153
- Ant. 1 and 3	190	15	
	191	16	155, 190, 201 156–57
– Myra 3 – 2	191	17	157
- 2 4			
7	49, 108, 191	19	153
	104, 176, 229	20	156–57, 190, 201
9.19	459	21	363
12.3	90	22	157, 161
12.5	91	26	153, 158
14.1	192	27	159–60
26	213	29	230, 375
28	130	30	410
33–35	130	31	161
47	35	33–34	161
Acts of Paul and T	'hecla	34	162, 191
- and Acta marty		36	160
- and Augustine		36–37	162
- and Carthaginia		38	191
154		39	162, 191
- coiffures 158		40-42	163
- crowd 201		40	191
- crowns 159		43	155, 163
- and elite 153		 see also Acts of P 	aul
	, 145, 154, 160, 191, 237,	Acts of Peter	
375		- and Acts of John	112, 182
– female readersh	ip 109–10	- and Acts of Paul	
 and feminism 	_	 and Actus Silvest 	
- love sickness 1		 Q. Iulius Balbus 	
- and Perpetua 154, 161, 230, 375		- conversion 187–90	
- Paul's appearance 151–52		- date 145-47, 222-23	
- R(r)esurrection 162, 172		- dog 188, 211	2 23
- seals 162		- fish 211	
- and Seleucia 1	63	 Latin translation 	140 146-47 209
- Thamyris 153	00	223	110, 110 17, 207,
- Theoclia 153		- Granius Marcell	us 113 145
- tour of hell 17	3		111, 135–36, 139–42,
tour or nen 1/	-	146, 188, 211, 223	
		170, 100, 211, 22.	,, 230

 miracles in 142 and Nicomedia and Perpetua 1: Peter vs Simon M place of composition and Priscillianistic resurrections 1- Rufina 134, 172 senators/senatori and sex 134-35 and statue emperorum and virgins 134 and widows 50 women 133-40 1 	39, 146, 230 Iagus 208–16 tion 143–45 s 223–24 42, 144, 188–89, 211–16 1, 188 al women 145–46 or 188 –35	- Mart. Petri 30 137 Acts of Philip 225 - tour of hell 337 Acts of Thomas 38 - and Achilles Tatius 170, 228, 242 - and Acts of Andrew 170 - and Acts of John 170 - and Acts of Paul 176 - angelus interpres 324 - author 169-70 - and Bardaisan 170 - bedrooms 175 - chastity in 171
2	134, 172, 188	- Christian virtues 174
3	137, 145	- date of 169
4	134, 140–41, 145,	– demonstrative pronouns 325
	188–89, 209, 211	– and Edessa 167–69
6	188	- flute girl 171
8	50, 108, 135	- freedom 176
11	128, 147, 188, 206–07,	 Greek and Syriac versions 170
	223	- and Heliodorus 168-69
13	142	- Hymn of the Pearl 167-68
14	188	– and India 240
15	142, 211	– Latin translation 224
16	104, 459	and Mani(chaeans) 168
17	34, 36, 211	– mire 325
19	136	– Mnasara 176–77
19–20	188	- Mygdonia 168, 173-74, 176
19–21	30, 135	- and Nisibis 168-69
21		– pasgriba 167–68
22	50, 108, 136	 place of composition 167–68
23–24	135, 189 217	– polymorphy 177
25 - 24	212	– proskynêsis 174
25–28	189	- Roman names and institutions 169
27	135, 146	– Tertia 176
28		- tour of hell 324-25
20	50, 108, 135, 143–44,	- widows 173
29	201, 214, 248	– women 171–77
30	135	- 3.17-19 169
	35, 36, 137	4–5 171
31–32	190, 216	8–9 171
33	38, 190	8 173
34–39	190	16 171
34	137	20 201
40	143	39 176
41	5	41 5
- Coptic fragment	134	44 207
		20/

46	207	Amsler, F. 236
51 and 53	172	Andronicus 102–04, 110, 112
53–54 55–57	213	A(n)noubion 246, 252–56
55–57 59	173, 324 173	- date 254
62–64	204	- and Dorotheus 254-55
64	173	 and Firmicus Maternus 254
73–4	128, 207	– name 253
75	207	 and pseudo-Manetho 254
77	128, 207	– and Rhetorios 255
82	174	Antonius Diogenes 227, 233
83	173	Aphrodisias 112–13, 117
84-86	174	-
87	174	A(p)pion 256–64 – and Alexandria 259
89	175–76	- and Alexandria 239 - anti-Semitism 261–62
92	174	
96	175	birth place 257–58grammarian 259–61
100	173	- and magic 263
104	201	- name 256–57
106	141	- necromancy 247, 263–64
118	176	- Pleistonikes 258
120–21	176	- FGrH 616 F1-21 262
129	174	Apocalypse of Abraham
134	173	- ascent 342
136–37	176	- 21 320
138	174	21.6 463
142	176	22, 23 and 25 342
151	177	
154 155	177 174	Apocalypse of Elijah 325–26, 336–37 – date and place 325–26
157	239	- tour of hell 336–37
159	177	
166	176	Apocalypse of Moses
		37.3 277
agape/dilectio 71	, 406	Apocalypse of Paul 296–312
Agape, Irene and	Chione	- and Apocalypse of Peter 297
3.2	9	- and Apocalypse of Zephaniah 327
4.2	37, 107, 226	– and Barhebraeus 300
7	9	- charity 308
Alexander of Abu	noteichos 138	- crimes 304-09
Alexander Polyhis	tor 322	date 299–302demonstrative pronouns 328
Amat, J. 374, 406, 410–11, 426, 429,		
440–41, 443, 445–47, 452		Eucharist 305fast 307
		- and Historia Apollonii Tyrii 299
ambon 368, 457		- homosexuality/lesbianism 307
Ambrose, De vidu	is 59	- Latin translation 302
Ambrosiaster 63		- lector 305, 310
Ammia 85		– magic 307

- and monks 30 - Nestorian confil - and Origen 30 - place 298-99, - priest 304-05 - punishments 30 - respite of punish - river of fire 30 - sinners 304 - sins 327 - text and translat - torture 310-11 - and virgins 30 - and widows/org - 1-2 9 13 16 22-23 23 24 29-30 31 34 35 36 37 39 39-40 40	ict 309 10 302 309–12 10 11 12 19, 327–28 16	- date 281–83 - demonstrative pronouns 292, 324, 336 - discovery 256, 295, 313 - and Egypt 280, 282–83 - Elysian fields 277 - and 1 Enoch 282 - and Epistula Apostolorum 283 - Ethiopic text 273 - Greek fragments 274 - Greek mythology 287 - and Lucian 283 - magic 307 - and Orphism 278–80, 287–88, 292–93 - place 281–83 - punishments 324, 336 - and Septuagint 283 - sexuality 290 - sins 324, 327 - smells 286 - and talio 286, 336 - Tartarouchos 275–76 - Temelouchos 276–77 - and Theophilus 283 - 1G 87 2.1–4E 326 6.11–15E 326 7.1–2E 325 7.5–6E 325 8E 286 9E 50, 287, 289
44 45	300 463–64	10E 287, 289
Apocalypse of Pau 342–43		11.4–5E 287 12.4–7E 307 13–14E 274
Apocalypse of Pete		15G 321 15–16E 321
- Acherusian Lak		15–17E 282
- and Alexandria		16E 461
angelus interpres 292, 324, 336and Apocalypse of Paul 297		22G 324–25, 336
- and apocalypticism 275		23–24G 278–79, 282, 286, 292,
– and Bar Kokhba 281–82		325 23G 272
 blasphemy/pers 	ecution 288	24G 272 24G 324–25
- and blood 286		25G 272
– βόρβορος 278-		27G 271
 catalogues of sin 	nners 292–93	28G 287, 289
- cats 282		30G 311
- crime categories		
- crimes and puni	shments 284–91	

31G	279, 282, 286, 292, 325	10.31 10.34.3	415 414
32G	272, 287, 289	10.6	201
Apocalypse of Zep 336–37 – and Apocalypse	bhaniah 304, 326,	<i>Ardā Virāz</i> 312 Aricia 140, 209	
date and placesins 327	326–27	Aristides 15	7
- tour of hell 33	36–37	Aristippe 102	
Apocryphal Acts - animals in 176 - authors 219-2		Aristobula 102 Aristophanes	
chronology 2conversion 18	21–25 1–96	 Frogs 145–81, 273 Knights	282
- crowd 106, 14		1362–3	286
and female readand feminismfluidity of text	99, 149	Arnobius, <i>Adv.</i> 2.13 and 2.62	Nat. 340
 Latin translatio magic 197–213 	n 223–24	Artemidorus 3.52	16
and Manichaeaand miracles	ns 224	Ascension of Isai – Isaiah 93	ah
- and novel 101		- 4.21	335
- and Origen 16		6	89, 92
- and historical p		6–11	94
- place of compos		6.10	339
- and Priscilliani		6.17	95
- readership 22		7.5	339
	173, 212 (indirect)	9.13	94
- and Roman wo		10.7–10	335
- theatre 106, 1	5/, 184, 208	11.36	94
– visions 100	77 70 220 24	ascents 338-45	
– and women 12	77-79, 230-34	 of Apollonius 	
Apollonius		- and 1 Enoch	334
2	9	- of Elijah 343	
Apuleius		– and Er 339	2.42
- creativity 220		- first person ac	count 340
- Apol.		- Gnostic 343	220 20
82	156	Iranian influerof Jesus 343	1ce 338-39
- Met.	201	 layered heaven 	is 340–41
1.10	201	- Mesopotamiai	
2.27–30	215		4-43
2.28	201, 215		343
2.29 3.21	216 210	- of soul 339	
4.26	118	Asinius Pollio	321
9.29	201		
·	_**	assize system 1	00, 156, 457

Athenagoras, <i>Leg.</i> 1.3	7	<i>3 Baruch</i> 10.2	277
26.4–5	66	bath 134	
Athenodorus 251	-53	- mixed 203	
Athenogenes 352		Bastiaensen, A.A.F 411, 430, 440, 44	R. VIII, 387, 408, 6–47, 451–52
Augustine			
De bono viduitatContra Adimant		Bauckham, R. 27	
- Contra Autmanti	147, 223–24	Beek, C.I.M.I van	353, 390, 411, 426,
- Contra adverver	sarium legis et		-7
prophetarum		<i>bêma</i> 130, 156, 45	0/
20	224	Bible	
– Contra Faustum		– Gen	
22, 30.4 and 79	224	3.14	383
– De natura et orig	ine animae	3.15	369, 415
1.10.12	431–32	28	367
- De sermone dom	ini in monte	- Lev	
1.20	224	18.22	291
- Enchiridion		- 1Kings	
29.112-3	300	17	53
- <i>Ep</i> .		– Isaiah	
3*	60	7.14	93
28*.2	390	– Ez	
29*.1.2	392	40-48	333
93.38	432	- Zech	
134.4	390	1–8	333
139.1	390	14.6–7	462
- De haer.	370	- Mt	
- Be much.	101	2.4	66
- Sermo	101	4.6	209
309.1	355	4.8	320
315.1	355, 391	5.7	126
382	390	7.13–14	369
- Treatise on John	370	8.3	395
98.8	300	8.28	125
	300	8.29	126, 205
Augustus 78		10.10	175
		12.45	125
Bakhtin, M. 365		13.8	59
	1/7 /0 2/2	13.52	66
	167–69, 240	16.21	66
- and Achilles Tati	*	20.18	66
- and astrology 2	256	21.32	289
- and Egypt 264	1.0	23.34	66
- FGrH 719 Fl and		24.40–41	326
- Leg. 170, p. 5 Dri	ijvers 23, 179	27.26	416
Bartelink, G.J.M.	VIII	27.51	78
		4/.31	70

	Mark		6	46
_	1.24	205	6.1	17
	1.25	128, 207	7.58–60	418
	1.26	128, 207	8.5–25	208
	1.43	127, 207	9.36	17
	2.12	127, 207	9.36-43	46
	3.31–35	363	9.39	17
	5.2–5	125	10.1	202, 248
	5.7	205	11.26	7
	5.8	128, 207	11.26 11.27 and 28	82
	5.13		12.6–10	435
	6.9	128, 207 175	13.1	82
	9.18	205	13.50	
			14	27, 35, 164
	9.20 9.25	126, 128, 205, 207 127–28, 207	15.22	140–41, 150 82
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	15.22	77
	10.38–39	378		82
	13	8	15.32	
	12.40-44	44	16.18	128, 207
	14.23	379	16.26–34	188, 435
	16.9	125	17.12	27
_	Luke	45	19.6	83
	2.36–38	45	21.8–9	82
	4.26	45	21.10–11	82
	4.41	207	21.25	77
	5.25	395	26.24	157
	7.11–17	45	28.6	140
	8.2	125	31.1	82
	8.27		- Rom	-
	8.28	126, 205	1.1	5
	11.26	125	1.26	291
	12.51–53	363	12.6	82–83
	16.24–26	376	15.26	17
	17.34–36		- 1Cor	207
	18.1–8	45	1	396
	21.1–4	45	7.8–9 and 39–40	47
	22.20 and 42	379	11.4–5	82
_	John	214	11.15	81
	11.39	214	12.10	94
	11.45	408	12.11	82
	12.42	408	12.28–29	82
_	Acts	92	13.2	83
	2.16–21	83	13-19	82
	2.42–47	75 17	14.1–25	83
	2.44-45	17	14.1	82
	4.4	408	14.3	82
	4.32–37	75 17	14.5	82
	4.34–37	17	14.31	82
	5.19	435	14.39	82

14 221 26	0.5	D	
14.33b-36	85 88	– Rev 1.1	87
14.36	82	1.3	
14.39 16.8	82 47		19, 68
- 2Cor	4/	1.10 1.13	87 446
2.14–15	452	1.13–14	371
12	396	1.13–14	446
12.1–4	340	1.15	446
	340	2.20–23	84
Ephes2.20, 3.5 and 4.11	82	4.2	87
5.2	452	4.8	446
– Phil	432	4.10	447
1.1	5	6.11	446
- Col	3	7.9	446
4.14	150	11.18	84
4.16	19, 68	13–14	446
– 1Thess	17, 00	16.13	87
- 11 ness 1.1	25	17.3	87
4.13–18	30	18.20	84
5.20	82	19.20	87
5.27	19, 68	20.10	87
– 1Tim	17,00	21.10	87, 320
1.18	87	21.23	462
2.9	48	22.5	462
4.13	19, 68		
4.14	83, 85	Bickerman, E. 7-	
5.3–16	48–49	Blandina 4, 27, 3	3, 130, 363–64, 398
6.1	289	blasphemy 289	
- 2Tim	207	Boeft, J. den VII,	130
2.10	24	•	437
4.8	407	Bömer, F. 323	
4.10	150	Bolkestein, H. 1	6
- Titus	15 4	Boll, F. 221	
1.1	5, 24	Bolyki, J. IX	
2.3	40, 107		
2.5	289	Bonnet, M. IX, 17	76
- Philemon		Book of Muhamm	ad's Ladder
16	27	79	328, 338
24	150	Rook of the Resur	rection of Jesus Christ
- Hebrews		46.3	277
11.38	308		
– James		Bourdieu, P. 13, 2	8
1.27	17, 48	Bousset, W. 4	
- 2Peter	,	Bowersock, G. 28	3
2.1	87	Bowie, E. 225, 22	
2.21	289		
– 1John	87	bribery 70–71, 1	·
v		Brown, P. 39-40,	53, 57–58

Brüderlichkeitseth	ik 75	– portrait 101	
Brunt, P. 10		– as sophist 74	
Burrus, V. 109		Christian(s)/ity	
Darras, 11 107		– as 'atheists' 74	
		– baptism 465	
Caesar, death 78		 bonding and bridging 25–28, 430 	
Callimachus, yout	h in Acts of John	– in brothel 121–22, 160	
102-04		- catechumenate 427-28	
Canones Hippolyti	į	- and charity 16-17, 73, 108-09, 163	
5, 9 and 32	56	- and Christ/Jesus 3-6, 363-64	
Carpocratians 10	01	- and codex 19-20, 122 (miniature),	
Carpus, Papylus ar		135–36 – as collegia/thiasoi 14–16	
- (Lat.)	iu riguinomice 157	- and Cynics 76	
3.5	9	- and damnation 30, 106–07, 184,	
5	4, 371	406–07	
- (Greek)	1, 37 1	- divides families 21–23, 363, 393	
5	7	- egalitarianism 26, 430	
23–24	9	- family aspects 20–25	
36	363	- interconnectedness 18–20	
47	352	- and laughter 141	
Cassius Dio		- and life everlasting 30-31, 73	
56.31.2–43.1	343	- and literacy 18-20, 71-72, 231-32	
56.45.2	78	- love God 29-30	
57.13.1	111	- miracles free 248-49	
59.11.4	78	 and mystery cult 69–70 	
60.2	174	– names of 7–12	
73.4.7	175	– number 231–32	
castration 110, 29		– Paradise 442	
	, 0	- and prophecy 81-95	
catasta 368		reading Scriptures 68	
Celsus 15, 73		– religious capital 28–31	
– on prophets 83	}	and salvation 30	
Chariton, and Cle	mentines 229, 242	– siblings 24, 396	
- Xenophon of Ep		- as 'slaves' 5	
- Callirhoe 109,		– social capital 16–28	
- 1.4.13-5.1	229	 and upper class males 28 	
1.5	144	and (upper class) women 33–41,	
2.5.4, 4.3.1, 4.4.3	and 6.7.10 164	177–79, 231	
Chiarini, G. 406-07, 410, 437, 451		- and widows 43-64, 178	
		- write in prison 356, 440	
Christ/Jesus, and	Cymics 76	- young 23-24, 179, 191-92, 195, 427	
- death 78	rd 371	Christiana/us sum 9-11, 145, 360, 394	
- as Good Shephe	1u 3/1	Chryse 5, 36, 137	
as Kyrios 5-6as lawgiver 21,	69 74	Chrysostom	
	/miracles 142, 184	- and Antioch 326	
	36–37, 177, 184, 189	und 1111110011 320	
- porymorphy 1	50-57, 177, 104, 107		

- Contra Iudaeos	at gamtas	location 240	1
10	311	1.5	245
- Life of Olympia		1.6.1	236
4	62	1.17.1	236
- Oratio ad vidua		2.24	246
- PG 51.321-38; 59		2.26	247
•	,,323D 30	2.26, 3-6	235
church		2.30	247
- house 25	,	2.32	264
- pluralisation 2	6	2.34	245, 249
Cicero		4.3	246
– Ad Atticum		4.4	245
2.3.2	443	4.6	251, 258
2.12.2	406	4.12	252
13.30.1	407	5.2	262
– <i>Rep</i> .		5.3	263
6.11	320	5.27	262
Clemens Alexandr	inus	7.9	251
- Ecl.		6.1	251
48	276	6.3	260
- Paed.		7.10	248
3.4.28-29	34	8.3	243
- Strom.		9.3-5	244
1.21.3	262	9.4–5	244
3.27.1.5	70	14.11	246, 252
2.144.1	399	14.12	253
1 Clement		17	251
	6	20.4–6	202
- 5.7	364	20.11	253, 258
8.4	51	20.13, 17	251
60.2	5	20.21	252
		20.21–22	251
Clementines, Pseud		- Recognitions	
- and Antonius D	logenes 242, 248		ne, date and loca-
- author 241	2.42	tion 240	,
- and Bardaisan		1.5	199, 245
- and Chariton		1.30.2-3	198
- date and place of	197, 239–41	2.2	247
- Faustus 237		2.9	210
,	235–38	2.13.1-2	200
	ollonii Tyrii 242, 256	3.47 and 57	210
- and Iamblichus		4.29.1	244
- Mattidia 237, 253		4.7.2	205, 207
	fectum in Matthae-	4.27	243-44
um 249		8.2.2	252,
- and Posidonius	242	9.29.2	240
- text 235-38		10.9	255
- Homilies		10.10.7–13	240
date 240–41			· -

10.52 10.55.3 10.56 10.58–59 10.59 10.62–63 10.63–64	252, 258 202, 248, 251 252 252 251 252 251	 and miracles 18 and mission 19 as process 184, and social status of women 195 of young 195 	6 194–95 188
Cleomedes		Cornelius, bishop	52, 63
2.1.91	16	Cooper, K. 219	
Cleopatra 100-02	2 110	craticula 325–26	
Clionius 91	., 110	Crispina 33	
		Croix, G.E.M. de S	Ste 10
Codex Theodosiani 2.8.1	us 312	crucifixion 121, 1	30
2.8.18	312	culleus 121	
3.11.1	61	curiosi 147, 223	
8.8.1	312	curiositas 406–07	
8.8.3	312		
8.16.1	60	Cynics 66, 76	
9.7.6	307	Cybele 36, 40	
9.7.10	312	Cynegius 299	
9.7.13	312	Cyprian, bishop	
9.21.4	60	- influential 458-	-59
9.25.1–3	61	 and martyrdom 	379
9.38.3, 8	311	- Ad Donat.	
9.38.7–8	311	10	368
16.2.20	62	- Carm.	
16.2.27–28 16.10.12.1	62	6.227	444, 461
	307	– De bono pat.	
Coleman, K. 398,	414	14	373
Coluthus 10		– De habitu virginum	
confessores 458-5	9	13	412
Constitutio Sirmon		– De lapsis	
7–8	311	25–26	172
		26	373
Constantine 304,		- (Pseudo-Cypria	•
Constitutiones Apo	stolicae	8	368
3.6.3 and 3.7.3	54	21	444
3.16.1	55	- <i>Ep</i> .	457
6.17.4	55	1.1.1	457
8.13.14	56	5.1, 6.4	440
conversion 105, 1	81–96	7.1.1	71
	88, 196	12.2 13.3.1	71 369
 and discourses 	190	14.2	71
	42	15.1.2	373
	62, 191–92	21	375, 461–62
– of lion 192		22.2	445

23	449	– as dogs 204	
28.1.2	379, 440	- exorcism 127–28, 141, 206–08	
30–31	449	- initiative 205	
36	449	- kills 126, 205	
37.2.2	379	- leaving 128, 207	
39.2.1	440	- motor disorder 126, 204-05	
39.2.2 39.5.2	369, 415 459	number 125, 204parhedros 124	
40.1.2	459	- parneuros 124 - resists 206–07	
45.2	459	- Semmath/Sammoth 124, 200	
57.2.2	379	- smiling 141	
58.9.1	369, 415	- strikes 125, 204	
58.9.2	379		
59.19.1	459	Demosthenes	
60.1.2	440	43.62 49	
69.15	128, 207	Descents	
75.4.3	447	- catalogues of sinners 316–17	
76.4.2	379	- first person account 316	
77.2.1	351, 391	Mesopotamian 329of Odysseus 313, 316, 330	
Cyprian, magician	123, 200, 246	- of Heracles 314, 316–18, 330	
Cyprian		- of Orpheus 314-16, 318, 330-32	
1.2	9	- of Pythagoras 330-31	
$3^2.3$	394	- and Vergil 334-35	
$3^2.6$	466	Devil 361, 369	
4.1	161	– black 382	
5.5	31	Didache	
Czachesz, I. 290		- and prophets 86-87	
		- 10.7 86	
damnatio ad hestia	as 161, 310, 382, 400	11.2 84	
	3 101, 310, 302, 100	12 75	
Dasius 4.4	363	15.1 84	
	363	Didascalia Apostolorum 54, 56, 239	
Davies, S.L. 99		Diebner, B.J. 327	
deaconesses 56		Diels, H. 237, 270, 328	
Dead Sea Scrolls			
1QS 4.10-11	289	Dieterich, A. 272–75, 277, 286, 291–92,	
4Q213	341	295, 313–14, 317, 333	
4Q372 1 13	289	dikaiosynê 289–90	
Decius, persecution by 11–12, 240, 352		dikrossion 102, 187	
Dehandschutter, B. 423		Diocletian, persecution 310	
Deissmann, A. 4		diogmitae 155, 165	
demon		Dionysios of Alexandria 351	
- as animals 125, 204		Dioscurus 352	
- and apostle 126-27			
- and bath 124-26, 203		Diospolis 253–54	
- black 125, 138,	204	divinisation 140-41, 171, 189	

Dölger, F. 138		22.8-10	446
Dolbeau, F. 426, 45	51	Epicurus 38	
doors, automaticall 187, 192, 435	ly opening 103, 177,	Epiphanius, <i>Haer</i> . 33. 3–7	34
Dorcas 17		51.33	85
Drijvers, H.J.W. 16	57, 174, 176, 241	epiphany	
	, 109–11, 113–14, 133	not anthropomosmiling in 103-	
Drusilla 78		Eubola 34, 36, 13	8, 211
Dunn, P.W. 99 eagle 78		Eucharist 378 - and milk 465 - wineless 152	
		euergetism, male as	nd famala 62
Eck, W. 75, 146			nu iemaie 62
Egeria 427		Eunapios 489	69
Egger, B. 233		_	07
Egyptians/Ethiopi	ans	Euplus 1	4, 9, 31, 360
- athletes 382	220 202	2.2G	363
– black 139, 209,	230, 362	Eusebius	
Eitrem, S. 209		- HE	
ekklêsia 25		3.1	169
Engberg, J. 193–94	}	3.31.3	86
1 Enoch 275, 317,	321	4.15.4	311
 angelus interpres 		4.15.47	351
- and ascent 334,		4.23.10	52
 demonstrative pr 	conouns 318, 333	4.23.13	37, 145
– and Er 334		5 praef. 2	351
- and Homer 318		5.1.41-42	130
•	335	5.2.3 5.3.4	445 88
- and Vergil 320,		5.16.7	90
- 14 14.8-24	334 342	5.16.14	88
15.1	342	5.17.2	88, 90
17.1–5	332–32	5.18.4	88
17–18	320	5.24.2	86
17–19	318, 332	5.173-74	85
17–22	292	6.3.1-6	357
18.13	318	6.5.6	375
19.3	318	6.14.1	283
91.7	289	6.43	108
96.7	289	6.43.11–12	36
108	288	7.11.3–11	351
2 Enoch 340-41		8.9.5	457
- 4	447	Vita Const.4.18–20	312
8 and 20	445	τ.10−2∪	J12

exorcism, etymology 243		Fridh, Å. 430, 440–41, 445		
- see s.v. demon		friend of the Emperor 136, 144		
		Fructuosus		
Favorinus 214		2.3	9	
Felicitas 4, 27, 38	37–401	5	30	
- giving birth 3		7	352	
– burial 401		7.2	369, 415	
- catechumen 3	89	Fukayama, F. 14		
- daughter 396		funeral, Roman 1	44	
– death 397–98,	400			
- husband 429		Gallonius 4, 352		
marriage 393pregnant 395		Gamble, H. 19, 13	4	
- and Revocatus	387		O	
- slave 388-89,	429	genesis 252		
- young 393		gentleness 117		
Felix 9		Gibbon, E. 129, 20	08	
- 1	447	Glykon 138		
Feraboli, S. 255		Goff, J. le 161		
Festugière, AJ.	174	Gordon, R. 201		
Ficker, G. 145		gospel, as amulet	122	
Finke, R. 29		Gospel of the Naza	renes 171	
first of 102, 112-	-13, 153, 158–59,	Gospel of Truth		
163–65, 168		21	343	
Flavius Josephus		gossip 54–55		
- <i>AJ</i>		gradus 368		
8.47	127	Graf, F. 279		
12.142 18.82	66 35	Griesbach, J.J. 236		
20.42	263	Guddenis 352		
20.195	35	– prison 376		
- Bell. Jud.				
2.20.2	35	Habermehl, P. 364, 366-67, 374, 437		
- C. Ap.	250	Hägg, T. 219, 225, 227, 233, 242		
2.2, 12 and 15	259		7, 33, 93, 230, 269–70	
2.29 and 41 2.135	257, 259 259		7, 55, 75, 250, 207-70	
2.270-71	290	Hardy, E.G. 10		
- Vita		Harris, J.R. 426		
16	35	Hatch, E. 15		
Flora 34		heaven		
Formisano, M. 43	37	above 443, 466climate 443–44	- above 443, 466	
Fortunatus 103-04, 111		- curiosity about		
Forum Iulium 2	12, 248	- cypresses 460–61		

 high trees 460 as immense garden 370, 450 journey to 460 as locus amoenus 460 light 443-44, 446, 462 and martyrdom 466 multitude of people 451 as palace 445 and Paradise 467 as park 443, 461 no seasons 462 		2.4.3 3.1.2 3.1.8 3.5.1 4.1 4.1.3 4.2.2 and 5.1 Hilarianus 360-6 415, 441 Hilhorst, A. XIII	52 367 86 86 369 367 371 52, 373, 380, 382, 393,
no seasons 462smell 452		Hill, C. 451	
and spring 461visions of 455-67white 458		Himmelfarb, M. 2 291–92, 313–14, 3 336	X, 274–75, 277, 280, 318, 320, 325, 333–34,
Heilen, S. 255 Heinrici, G. 15		Hippolytus, Comn 1.22	n. in Daniel. 37
Heintze, W. 237, 241, 2 Heliodorus - Aethiopica 168 - and Achilles Tatius - and Acts of Thomas - 2.19 6.14, 21, 65	337 168–69 175 212	Historia Apollonii - and Apocalypse of - and Clementines - 31 RA, RB 51.26–28B Holzberg, N. 219 homosexuality 29	of Paul 299 242, 256 116 299
6.14-15	247	· ·	3, 71, 167, 177–79, 191,
8.9 hell 295–312, 376	201	231–32, 350–51	
Hermas		Horace, Jewish influence 322	
- Mand.		Horsfall, N. 321–2	
4.4	52	Horst, P.W. van der	259
5.2.2	27	Hume, D. 34	
8.10	52		
11 11.9	93 87	Ignatius	
11.9–10a	93	- Ephes.	
11.12	86	2	71
11.13	87	12.2	70
- Sim.		- Magn.	F
1.8, 5.3.7, 9.15.4	86	2	5
9.16.5	86	4 15	7 71
9.25.2	86	- <i>Rom</i>	/ 1
9.26.2 and 27.2	52, 108	3	7
- Vis.		- Smyrn.	,
1.1.3	380, 460	4.1 and 6.2	49
1.2.2	371	9.12	71
1.7	69	11	72
2.4.2	226		

13.1	49		- SEG		
- Pol.	7/		26.261	160	
- 10i. 7	72		24.1055	68	
– Trall.	72		30.93	277	
- 17att.	71		31.1202	137	
_			31.1316	164	
incest 118–19, 12	1		33.1602	36	
inn 142			34.695	68	
– in Edessa 172			35.1330	117	
inscriptions			36.1277	172	
- AE			36.970.A.11–2	362	
1968.227–28	362		37.544.2, 4	129	
1993.828	160		38.1586	165	
1995.1775	429		40.1568	253	
- CIRB	127		41.1329A.4	15	
1259, 1260–61, 1	277_87 1289	15	41.1343, 1345-4		
- I. Alexandreia	277 07, 1207	13	43.441	116	
187	446				
- I. Delos	110		43.850	117	
290	277		44.1279	276	
1641b6	68		48.1120	15	
- <i>IGR</i>	00		51.1811 D.II.11	164	
3.115	115		55.1463bis	15	
4.1094.74–5	140		55.1492	164	
			57.779	15	
	73		58.1538	11	
- I. Istros			- TAM		
193	68		III. 118.3, 180.3,	596.2 and 697.1	129
- I. Iznik	1000 111		V.2.310		85
196, 1062, 1201,	1208 116		V.2.1326 and V.3		11
- I. Perge			 Tabbernee, Mon 		is, nos.
294 and 321	68		9, 10, 17, 19	11	
- I. Pessinous			Iragaray, I. 365		
170	69		Irenaeus, Adv. hae	24*	
– I.Prusias			1.13.2–3	34, 90, 124, 200	١
7.2.22	129		1.13.5	90	,
– I. Smyrna			1.21.3	70	
652	260		1.23.4–5	245	
- LSAM			1.25.6	101	
80.10	68		2.32.4		
-MAMA				86, 104–05	
IV.4	88		5.6.1	86	
V.23	88		Irenaeus		
XI.9	150, 95, 122		3.1–2	24	
164	11		4.9	363, 394	
– O. Masada			5.2	363	
788	257		Isis 36		
- RECAM					
ii.324	116				

James, M.R. 269		54	70	
James, William 18	81, 193	66.4	70	
Jerome		67.7	108	
	-63	- 2Apol.	24 25 20	
- Adv. Jov.		2 3	34–35, 38 76, 102	
2.14	169	6	104	
 De viris illustr. 		- Tryph.	104	
12–13	259	60.6	105	
- <i>Ep</i> .		70 and 78	70	
22.16	61	Juvenal		
54 77.10	59, 62 62	3.296	16	
107–108	62	6.511–91	34	
123	59–60			
127	61–63	Kaestli, JD. 99, 1	07 110 145	
130.5	438			
130.13	61	katabaseis, see Des	cents	
– Vita Hil.		Kerényi, K. 221		
12	246	Kerygma(ta) Petro	u 237	
John		Khomeini, R. 420		
- apostle 99–110		Kippenberg, H. 404		
– portrait 101		Klauser, Th. 377		
Jones, C.P. 78		Klijn, A.F.J. 167, 13	73, 176	
Jones, S.F. 236, 239	9, 264	Klostermann, E. 2		
Jubilees 7.13 and 9.1	Jubilees Krach V VIII			
	244	Kristeva, J. 365		
Julian – and women 63		Kroll, W. 254		
- <i>Ep.</i>		Kron, w. 254		
84	16	T 1 T 22		
Julianus Africanus		Lachmann, K. 236		
T47.9	262	Lactantius, Mort pers.		
		5	369	
Junod, E. 107, 110,	143	36.7	310	
Justin 2.3	157	Lane Fox, R. 10, 3	4, 105–06, 230	
3.4	9	Leglay, M. 413		
4	9, 37	lesbianism 291		
5.2	363	Liber Flavus Fergu	siorum 107	
6	352	Lieu, J. 21		
Justin Martyr		Lightfoot, J. 296, 320		
- 1Apol.		Lipsius, R.A. IX		
21.3	78	•		
26	140	Lloyd-Jones, H. 314–15, 320		
29.2 67	70	logoi hieroi 71		
U/	18, 26, 52, 68			

Longus, Daphnis and Chloe 2.7 153		50 53	9 191	
love-sickness 262	-63	55	364	
	-03	56	4, 399	
Lucian – and Revelation	202	passim	363	
and Apocalypse ofand Christianity		2 Maccabees		
 and christianity and glossolalia 		6.30	364	
Alexander	70-71		501	
24	214	4 Maccabees 9.29 and 31	27.4	
25 and 38	284	10.20	364 364	
- Fug.	20.			
33	286	MacDonald, D. 99		
– Icaromenippus	339	MacMullen, R. 33-	-34, 37, 104	
- Onos 116		magic/magician 1	23-25	
- Per.			17	
9	66		47	
10	66	- boy mediums 2	247	
11	15, 66, 85	- and Egypt 200	, 233, 246	
11–13	284	- erotic 153, 155-		
12	50–51, 70, 107, 178	– evil eye 101, 18	2-83	
13	17–18, 21, 73–75, 214,	– exorcism 104–0	06, 123–29, 141–42,	
	396, 466	202-08		
14	75 	- and Fallen angels	s 243	
15	76	- flying 209–11		
16	77	– Ham 199, 243	100	
39–40 41	77–79 72	- instruction in		
- Philops.	12	- inventor 198–99, 243 - Jewish 202–03		
- <i>Thuops.</i>	141, 214		∩1	
14	201	and lynching 2and Manichaeisn		
16	127, 203, 205	- Memphis 246	11 21/	
31	127, 206	- Mestraim 199,	243_44	
34–36	123–24, 200, 246	- and money 200		
- <i>VH</i>	, ,	- and monks 307		
2.26	286	- and moon 209-	-10	
30	286, 324	- and Moses 212	, 246	
Lucilla 53		- Nebrod/Nimrod	1 244	
Luhmann, N. 13		- necromancy 24	5-47	
		– Nectabis 243		
Lycomedes 100–0	02, 110–11	– Ninus 244		
Lyons and Vienne	361	- Ostanes 243, 24	16	
- 1	352	- in Palestine 245		
10	9	- parhedros 200,		
19–20	9	- persecution of		
23	4	- public performan		
26	9, 107		38, 248	
35	364	- resurrections 2	14	

C : 245		14 . :
- Samaritan 245		Marinus 3 9
- secrecy 248	142	3
speechlessnessSimon Magus 2	142	marriage
	24	- age at 118, 134, 173
- Thebes 246	2 T	- Christian-pagan 177
- touching 142, 1	72	– unequal 120, 175
- Typhon 243	72	Martimort, A.G. 239
- ventriloquism	216	martyr(s)/dom
- whispering 189		- animals against 130, 459
- young 199	, 212 13	- as athletes 380
	oaster 198-99, 244	- as baptism 412-13
	045001 170 77,211	- birthday 352
Mani 34		- burned alive 429, 445
manus-marriage	38	- and Christ 3-5, 363-64, 371
Marcellus		- crowd protests 130
2.1	9	- crown 464
2.2	4	- cup of martyrdom 378-79, 465
Marcion 86, 145		- damnatio ad bestias 161
- M. literature 24	1 1	- dawn execution 130, 161, 410
		- delay for 10, 394
Marcus Aurelius	•	– Deo gratias 466
Marcus Magus 34	1, 90, 124, 200	– Donatist 390
Marianus		- and Eucharist 379
- date 456		– at festivals 161
- influence of Perp	petua 354, 365, 368,	- being first 370, 440
456		- flogging 130, 415
- low position 46	55–66	- God/Jesus suffers in them 396
- 2.2, 5	361	- hypomonê 363, 400
4.5	364	- immediate ascent to heaven 370, 419,
5.1	361	442, 459, 466
5.2	9	- intercession by 161, 375
5.4	361	- joy in suffering 364, 374, 396, 452–53
6	457	- nudity 161, 398
6.5	378, 465	- rational choice 418
6.6–11	368	- refrigerium 450
6.9	458	- and roses 450
6.9–10	443	ruling discourse 418–19and sacrifice 393
6.11–12	445	- sit with Christ 370, 459
6.11–15	377	- and Socrates 73
6.12–13	460	- and sword 458–59
6.14	458	- voluntary 74, 388, 418
6.15 7.1	448 378 465	- white clothes 446
7.1 7.3	378, 465 382, 784	- young 23-24, 387, 393, 418
7.5 7.6	382, 784 384	
8.2	22	Maxima, Donatilla et Secunda
9.2	364	2 and 4 24
/· <i>L</i>	301	

Maximilian		12.1	356, 440
1.2-3	9	13.1	458
2.4	4, 371	13.2, 6	364
2.6	9	17.1	396
3.3	364 9	21.1	364, 458
·	•	Morgan, J. 219–20	, 225, 233
Maximilla, Montai	nist 87–90	Musaeus 320, 335	i
Meeks, W. 29		Musurillo, H. 406	, 410, 437, 451
Merkelbach, R. 22	1	Myrte 91	
Methodius, Symp.			
Prel.7–8	463	necromancy 199,	246-471
2.6	276 460	- and Egypt 247	
		necrophilia 102, 1	180, 229
Meyboom, H.U. 2 Miller, P.C. 364–6		Nereus 94	
	us 361, 392, 426, 441	Nero, persecution	33
1		Nicklas, T. XIII	
Minnen, P. van 2		Nicomedia 113-1	4
Minucius Felix, Oc 9.2	21, 74, 396	Nock, A.D. 181, 19	93–96, 221, 427
12.5	14	Norden, E. 270-72	2, 286–87, 295–96,
miracles, immediat	ely 395	313–15, 317, 320-	
Mithras Liturgy	340	Norelli, E. 93	
- 748-49	340	novel, ancient	
Mommsen, Th. 328		- and Apocryphal.	
monks		- and astrology 2	255–56
- habitation 308		- authors 220	220
- and magic 307		fluidity of text 220readers of 228–29	
- white habit 308		- and women 232	
Montanism 87–9		nurse 175	
- and Ephesus 86		114130 173	
in Thyateira 85and women 88		Obbink, D. 251, 2	53_55
Montanus 87–88,	90	obstetrix 412	33-33
Montanus and Luc		Odes of Solomon	
- Eucharist 377-		42.11–22	335
- influence of <i>Perpetua</i> 354, 365			
- Paradise 443		oikonomos 116, 1	23
- 2	445	Olivieri, A. 254	
4.2	356	Oracula Sibyllina	1//2
7.3–5	466–67	2.327 2.335–38	462 277
7.6 8	368 377_78_464		2//
9.2	377–78, 464 371, 378	Origen	of Daul 200
11.2	371, 458	and Apocalypse of Catenae ad C	
	•, • • •	Sincipal all C	0.0000000000000000000000000000000000000

- CC		Palladius	
1.22-23	203	– Dial.	
1.27	26	5 63	
1.28	123, 200, 246	- HL	
1.38	123, 200, 246	65.3 157	
1.46	105, 123, 200, 246	Pamoun 352	
1.67	206	panegyris 77	
2.33	206	Pansophios 352	
3.9	35		
3.23	15	papyri	
3.24	206	- P.Diog.	120
3.28 3.44	206	6.3	129
	23, 26, 191	- PGM	124 222
3.55	34, 178	I.1–3	124, 200
3.59 4.33–4	70 203	I.191–219	211
	203	IV.222, 227, 249	247
5.45	203	IV.909–10	212
6.22	339	IV.1227 and 1242–4	128, 207
7.9, 11	83	IV.2335	276
8.48	106, 184	IV.3007ff	128, 207
orphans 17, 3	6, 70	IV.3037–41	127, 206
Orphism 271	, 277–78	V.158	128, 207
* .	bse of Peter 273	VII.282	125
- and afterlife		XII.79	124, 200
- catalogues of	f sinners 293	XII.163	436
- and Chaldaean Oracles 339		XIII.242–44	127, 206
 and Eleusis 		XIII.279–82,	215
- and Gnostic writings 339		XXXIV.3-7	210
	reanism 278–80	XXXVI.76	125
- underworld		- P.Kron.	4.00
- and Verg. Ae	n.	3.1	129
6.271	287	– <i>Р.Оху.</i>	0.2
- and Wilamov	witz 295, 315	1.5	93
- <i>OF</i>		3.486.1	129
1 and 3	320	4.840	171
19	320	9.1201.16	129
474-96	277	12.1475.10	129
708	316	14.1642.4 and 1727.1	129
717	287-88, 317, 321	21.2295	261
870	316	22.2337	261
980	315	32.2617, 42.3010	34
1103	316	42.3035	11
Ovid, Jewish ir	nfluence 322–23	36.2785	427
_ , 14, je w 1511 11		43.3119	11
		50.3429	10
Palestinians 4	03-05	50.3529	352
		54.3759, 37–39	312
		59.3965	261

64.4365, 70.4759 79.5201 - PSI 2.117 9.1041 - SB 1.4549, 12.10772 and 16 Paradise, spring 463	352 258–59 227 427 .12497 11	 husband 358 kissed 385, 447 knows Greek 140, 154–55, 357–58, 372, 449 and Pomponius 380–81 prison 376, 405 and Saturus 370, 442–43 self-confidence 367, 412, 465 sermons on 391
Pausanias 2.21.7	384, 446	- sermons on 391 - sex change 382-83 - visions 364-85 - young 418 Perpetua and Felicitas 349-454 - and Acts of Paul and Thecla 154-55, 161, 230, 375 - and Acts of Peter 139, 146, 230 - agônothetês 383-84 - amphitheatre 383-84 - animals 400-01 - Artaxius 445 - Aspasius 449 - authorship 355-56, 431-32 - baptism 377 - catechumens 427 - and Christ 416 - crowd 399 - date 354 - deacons 373 - Devil 361, 369, 384-385 - Dinocrates 373-79 - editor 434 - eros and thanatos 400 - and Euripides 399 - Eucharist 372-73 - and gladiatorial combats 384-85 - Greek version valuable 354, 380, 403-04, 440-41 - and Pythian Games 380-81, 383 - Geta 409 - heaven 419 - and Hermas 370
 and Eucharist 372–73 eyes 412 family 357–64 father 359–63 and Genesis 428 and gladiators 384–83 and Good Shepherd 33 	5	 Holy Spirit 432–34 influence 354, 391 Iucundus 426, 441 Latin not Greek original 353–54, 380 ladder 367–70 and Marianus 354, 365, 368, 456 last meal 405–06

 Last Judgment 	419	4.8	381, 427, 443
- magic 435-36	т17	4.9	466
- and <i>Montanus</i>	351 365	4.10	366, 369, 373
- Optatus 448-4	*	4.29	452
•	7	5.2	362
- papa 449	37	5.3	358
2 1			
,	99	5.4	362
- priests of Saturn	and Cereres 398,	5.6	364, 452
413–14		6.2	457
- prison 396	2/0 70 ///	6.3	441
- and Revelation		6.4	9, 360, 393
- Rusticus 425, 4		6.5	362, 415, 430
- Saturninus 429	·	6.6	382
- Secundulus 429		6.7	358, 369, 415
- seniores 447, 45		7	359
- sequence of mart	•	7–8	230
- serpent 369-70		7.1–9	373–74
- social status 42		7.4	354
 and Tertullian 	354, 397, 415, 434	7.9	356, 380
- text 404, 409		8	374, 464
- Thuburbo Minus	s 387–88, 425–26	8.2	377
- trishagion 446		9.1	405
- and Vita Cyprian	ni 354	10	139, 230
 written in prison 	356	10.3	460
- 1.1-3	351	10.8	367
1.6	423	10.11	415
2.1	154, 387, 441	10.14	361
2.1-2	423-31	10.15	433
2.1	357, 410	11	419
2.2	24, 358-59, 425, 429	11–13	441-42
2.3	357, 432	11–12	453
3.1	359	11.1	356, 440, 451
3.1-4	154	11.2	344
3.2	9	11.3	466
3.2-3	360	11.4	370, 462
3.3	361	11.5-6	371
3.5	356, 363, 373, 376,	11.9	426
	389, 396	12.1	381
3.6	376	12.3	371
3.7	356, 373, 380, 396	12.5	447
3.8	24, 356, 358 – 59, 405	12.7	370
4	366-67, 419	13	453
4.1-2	465	13.3	407
4.2-4	367	13.4	140, 358, 371, 441
4.3	443, 466	14	445
4.4	428	14.1	440
4.5	370, 425, 430, 440	14.3	440
4.6	443	15	394, 405
			,

15	4, 405	– Latin	
15.2	357, 451	1	368
15.3	451	Philip, and daughte	rs 82, 85–86, 89
15.5	395	Philo	
15.7	396	- <i>Hyp</i> . 290	
16	405	5	14
16.1	432	- Leg.	1T
16.2	435–37	- Leg. 368	289
17	405, 437–38	- Probus	207
17.1	71, 408, 419	- 1700us 85	15
17.2	406		13
18	409–10	1 0	320
18.2	4, 397	3.2	320
18.3	397	Philostratus, Life o	f Apollonius
18.4	398	1.15	143
18.7-8	406, 419	1.19	141
18.8	30, 380	3.15 and 17	141
18.9	364, 453	3.38 and 4.20	127, 207
19	130, 410	4.45	143
19.3-4	380	4.49	215
19.4	401	5.20	138
20	392, 410	6.2	139
20.1	361, 426	6.10-11	141
20.2	161	7.38	435
20.4	383	8.30	344
20.6	399	Picard, Ch. 413	
20.8	425, 430		
20.10	24, 359, 425	Pseudo-Phocylides	
21.1-8	410	6	288
21.9	154, 363, 400, 410	184–85	291
21.11	351	187	290
	331	192	291
Perpetua, Acta		229–30	289
- date 354, 391	204 02	Pionius	
- interrogation in	391–92	1	352
– text 389–90	440	1.2	356
– I.1	410	2.3	139
I.1.1	387, 429	3	106
I.4.1	393	9	37
I.5.2–8	392	8.2 and 4	9
I.5.5	429	9	37
I.7.1	429	9.5 and 7	9
I.9.2	397	11.2	352
I.9.3-4	400	11.5	157
II.1.1	387, 429	14.9	361
II.7.1	429	15.7 and 16.2	9
Peterson, E. 8, 104		18.1	161
Phileas 9, 22, 352		15.7, 16.2 and 18.6	9
1, 22, 332		21.5	352

23	352	12–13	143
Pizzolato, L. 434		12	9
Plato		14.2	370
- Leg.		17.2	4
909A	34	18.3 22.3	352 352
– Phaedo			332
69C	282	Polycrates 86	
114A	309, 327, 337	Pontius, Vita Cypr	riani
– Phaedrus		12.3-5	458
230B	460	Poppaea 35	
- Pol.	1/2	Porphyry	
272A	462	– De antro	
– <i>Rep</i> . 363D	282	24	339
615D, 616B	320	- Plot.	
- Symp.	320	9	38
218B	320	 F 4 Harnack – 7 	0 F Becker 35
- Tim.		Potamiaena and B	asilides
41E	320	5	9
Pleket, H.W. 4		Pouderon, B. 237-	-38, 242
Pliny, Ep .		Poupon, G. 146	
10.96.2	9, 360	Preuschen, E. 270	
10.96.7	14	priests, Jewish 65	5_66
Plotinus 38		Priscilla 87–88, 9	
Plutarch		,	
– and Er 339		prison	nts 396
- Life of Romulus		two compartmentcrowdedness 3	76
28.1	78	- dark 356, 376,	
- Mor.		- death in 445	
407C	34	- officers 188, 35	56
554B	398, 414	- writing in 356,	
815D	143	Prohairesios 69	
Poimandres		prophêtês 67	
25–26	340–41		
Poirier, PH. 167,	174	prophets 81–95	
Polemon 214		false 87male and female	81–82, 84
Polycarp, and Perp	etua 437	- and big cities 8	-
- 2.2	4, 396	- ecstasy 87, 90,	•
3.1	361	 and glossolalia 	
4.3	418	– number 91	, , , ,
8.2	364	- predictions 82	
9.3	4-5, 372	- ranking 82, 84	
10	9	- wandering 84,	91
11	31	- writings of 90,	92
11.2	30, 107, 437	prostatês 15,69	
		prostates 15,07	

Protevangelium of James 6 67 prôtopolitês 164 prôtos tês poleôs, title, see first of Prudentius - Cathemerinon 5.125-36 311 - Peristeph. 5.207 5.207 326 Ptolemaeus and Lucius 2 10 360 15-16 9-10 Putnam, R. 13, 29	- no cleric 440 - death 400 - irony 407 - kissed 447 - knows Greek 430, 449 - Latin not Greek original 440 - literacy 430 - name 440 - and Perpetua 370, 442–43 - social status 430 - vision 440–54 satyriskos 138 Sbordone, F. 163 Scaliger, J.J. 317 Schmidt, C. 134, 146, 164, 169, 236–27, 239–40, 252, 264
Quadratus 85 Quintillians 89 Radermacher, L. 320, 334 Reitzenstein, R. 270, 436	Schubert, P. 255 Scillitani 9–10 - 8
Religionsgeschichtliche Schule 270, 273 religious capital 29	16 392 17 466
retiarius 397, 412	scribes, Jewish 65–66 senator, age of 144
Robert, L. 138, 353, 380 Robinson, J.A. 269	Septimius Severus 146, 239 – persecution 357, 425, 440
Rohde, E. 221, 232	Sergius Paullus 75, 85
Roldanus, J. IX	Setaioli, A. 321 Shariati, A. 420
Romulus, ascension 78–79, 343 Rosenstiehl, JM. 276	Shaw, B. 39, 397, 446
Rüpke, J. XIII	Silverstein, T. 308
ruler cult 141, 143	Simon Magus 34, 133, 139, 208–16 – death of 88
Sabazios 40 Sabina 27 Saïd, S. 168 Saller, R. 39 Saturus 130	 divinisation 140-41 flies 141, 188, 190 and necromancy 246-47 vs Peter 208-16 robs Eubola 138, 211 voice 211-12 social capital 13-14
– and angels 443	1

Söder, R. 106, 219,	, 227	Tatum, J. 219	
Sozomen, HE		teletê 70	
6.3	61	Tertullian	
7.9.10	301	 and codex/scroll 	136
7.19.9	274, 301		54, 397, 415, 434
spiritual capital 2	28–29	- Adv. Marc.	, , ,
Stark, R. 29, 177-7	78, 231–32, 417–18	1.29.4	53
statue 140	,	2.21.2	407
statuettes 138		3.22	86
	2EE 201 410	- An. 9.4	89, 396
Stephen, protomar	tyr 333, 391, 418	55.4	451
Stephens, S. 225		57.1	243
Stock, B. 18		- Apol.	
Stoneman, R. 219		23.4	105
Strabo		27.14	461
7.3.4	34	38-39	14
11.14.2 and 16.1.23	168	39.4–5	447
Strecker, G. 239-4	10	39.8–10	21, 74
· ·		39.16	406
Stuckrad, K. von	404	42.5	406
Suetonius		47.13	461
- Aug.	2.42	50.13	31, 408
100	343	– <i>Bapt</i> . 5	70
- Nero 25	8	9.4	71
		17	373
	403–05, 416–22	17.5	111, 154, 163, 230, 375
discourse aboutfemale 417	419	- Cor.	,, ,,
- and Paradise 4	10 21 453	1	119
- voluntarily 417		15	70
- young 418		– De cultu feminar	rum
-		1.21.1	243
synagôgeus 68		2.10.2–3	243
synoptic/tabular m	nethod 236–37	- De exhortatione	
		3.1–2	434
Tabitha 46		11 and 12.2	53
Tacitus		– De idololatria 9.1	407
-Ann.		– De pallio	407
1.73	289	4.10	414
14.15.5	8	– De patientia	111
16.6	35	14.4	448
- Hist.		– De praesc. haer.	
1.51.3	8	14.2	407
Tatian, Or.		40	70, 407
32.1 and 33.1	23, 37, 191	41	373, 407

– De testimonio a	nimae	13.2	127, 206
2.7	414	17.3	205
- Fug.		18.21	205
9.4	395		
– Ieiun.		Thecla 149–63, 3	178
12.3 and 17	71	Theodotus 352	
- Mart.		6	368, 457
1.1 and 2	71	Theophilus, Autol	
- Mon.		2.8	105, 127, 206
12 and 16.3	53	theatre 104, 106,	129
- Nat.			12/
2.4.19	407	Thessalos 247	274
19.6	461	1.13–14	271
- Or.		12	254
3.3	461	Thomas, K. 35	
28	71	thiasarchês 67–6	8
- Pud.		thiasos 15,67	
13	53		
13.7	449	Tigchelaar, E. 282	
- Scap.		Tissot, Y. 167, 174	
4	35	Touati, C. 300	
- Scorp.	7	tours of hell 274-	-80, 292–93, 313–28,
9.8–9 Spect	/	333–38	
- Spect.	406	- charts 325	
12.6 - <i>Uxor</i> .	406	Traditio apostolica	36
- 0x07.	389	10, 20, 23 and 30	52
1.4.4	53	21	35
1.4.6	52	30	41
1.8.4	53	tribunal, see bêma	,
2.1.4	53		
2.1.4	17	Trumbower, J. 37	4
2.8.5	389	Turner, C.H. 146	
	367		
– Virg. vel. 9	373	Hannar H 254 2	70 273
9–10	53	Usener, H. 254, 23	70, 273
Tertullus 102, 11	_	Valentinus 38	
Testament of Abra		venationes/venatores 130, 159, 408, 415	
- 10	320	Verus 104, 112	
Testament of Job		Vergilius	
46-50	94	Jewish influence	321_22
Testament of Orp	heus 280, 282, 321	- Aeneid 6	321-22
Testamentum Don	nini 55	– angelus interpre	s 319
Testamentum Salo	omonis		ronouns 292, 319–20,
5.2ff	127, 206	334	
8.1	125	- and 1 Enoch 3	
12.2	205	 Orphic mysteric 	es 319–20

- Sibyl 319-20 - sinners 287-88 - Aen. 6 318-20 426-29 608-13 614-17 618-24 620	319 321 287, 317 288, 317 288, 317 287–88	 remarriage 61 in Roman world 48, 51–53, 70 over sixty 53 in Syria and Egypt 54–56, 173 Wilamowitz-Moellendorff, U. von 270, 295–96, 315, 328 Winkler, J. 365 Wolf, F.A. 328
678 - G. 1.475 4.467–69	78 316	women - in Antioch 35 - as authors 109 - drunk 107
Versnel, H.S. 413 Veyne, P. 39, 58 Via Sebaste 150,	165	and gnostics 102in Judaism 111liaisons 137letters 226
Vision of Ezra 33 Vouaux, L. 134, 14 vulture 78		 and literacy 37, 88, 109 in Luke 45–46 Manichaean 55 and Montanism 88 and mysticism 35
Waitz, H. 237, 239 walking 120 Weber, M. 35, 75 Weinreich, O. 435 Weinstock, S. 255 West, M.L. 316 Westra, L. 146 white 381 widows 17, 36, 43 – age 49, 60 – in Christian Em – criticism of 107 – in Greece 47–5	5–64 pire 56–63 7–08	networking 55 in novel 100 old 17, 40–41, 50, 70, 104–09, 135 as patronesses 36–37 Paul's followers 27 and philosophers 38 presumed gullibility 34 reading 225–31 and Reformation 38 and sects 45, 138 and sexuality 39–40, 57–63 and synagogue 36 upper class 33–41, 90 and virginity 39–40, 57
and New Testamorder of 53, 55and prayer 136	136, 179	Zalmoxis 331 Zatchlas 215–16, 247