Paul within Judaism

Edited by
MICHAEL BIRD,
RUBEN A. BÜHNER,
JÖRG FREY,
and BRIAN ROSNER

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 507

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

Herausgeber/Editor Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber/Associate Editors

Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala) Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) · Janet Spittler (Charlottesville, VA) J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)

507



Paul within Judaism

Perspectives on Paul and Jewish Identity

Edited by

Michael Bird, Ruben A. Bühner, Jörg Frey, and Brian Rosner

Michael Bird, born 1974; 2005 PhD; Academic Dean and Lecturer in New Testament at Ridley College, Melbourne, Australia (Australian College of Theology). orcid.org/0000-0001-8575-2583

Ruben Bühner, born 1990; 2020 Dr. theol.; PostDoc and Lecturer at the Department of New Testament Studies at the University of Zurich, Switzerland. orcid.org/0000-0002-7033-5637

Jörg Frey, born 1962; 1996 Dr. theol.; 1998 Habilitation; Professor of New Testament Studies at the University of Zurich, Switzerland. orcid.org/0000-0001-6628-8834

Brian Rosner, born 1959; 1991 PhD; Principal and Lecturer in New Testament at Ridley College, Melbourne, Australia (Australian College of Theology). orcid.org/0000-0003-3048-2795

The prepress production of this book and the eBook were published with the support of the Swiss National Science Foundation.

ISBN 978-3-16-162325-7 / eISBN 978-3-16-162440-7 DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-162440-7

ISSN 0512-1604 / eISSN 2568-7476

(Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available at https://dnb.de.

© 2023 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany. www.mohrsiebeck.com

This work is licensed under the license "Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International" (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). A complete version of the license text can be found at: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/. Any use not covered by the above license is prohibited and illegal without the permission of the publisher.

The book was typeset using Stempel Garamond typeface and printed on non-aging paper by Gulde Druck in Tübingen. It was bound by Buchbinderei Spinner in Ottersweier. Published by Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany. www.mohrsiebeck.com.

Printed in Germany.

Preface

Our volume *Paul within Judaism* is based on an on-line scholarly symposium organized by Ridley College in Melbourne, Australia, graciously sponsored by the Australian College of Theology, held during 21–24 September 2021. The topic of exploration was chosen because of the western fascination with the apostle Paul and the persistent challenge of exploring Paul in relation to both his Jewish heritage and his Messiah-believing commitments. In a sense, the tension to be explored or explained is how is Paul both "Paul the Jewish/Judean follower of Jesus" and simultaneously "St. Paul" of the church's faith and witness. This is the subject which continues to excite and energize scholars in their articulation of both ancient history as well as contemporary theological commitments and informing inter-faith relationships. The contributors to this volume are not monolithic and they represent a plurality of perspectives and diversity of approaches to Paul vis-à-vis ancient Judaism. It is the hope of the editors that this volume will continue the conversation about Paul and his Jewishness, not despite his being a Messiah-believer, but precisely as part of it.

While the conference took place under the aegis of Ridley College, the volume itself would not have been possible without the editorial team of Dr. Michael Bird, Dr. Brian Rosner, Dr. Ruben A. Bühner, and Prof. Jörg Frey, who all made contributions to the editing, production, and publication of this volume. Hopefully we have set a new benchmark in Euro-Antipodean cooperation, bringing Uluru and the Matterhorn (metaphorically) closer together. We remain grateful too for the editorial support of the Mohr Siebeck publishing team for their hard work in bringing this volume to fruition. We also wish to thank Tsion Seyoum Meren for compiling the indices of authors and ancient sources, and Ruben A. Bühner for the index of subjects. In addition, funding to make this volume open access was generously provided by the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF). The convulsions of COVID meant that such a meeting of learned scholars of religious antiquity and early Christianity were not able to meet in person. We had to settle for an on-line symposium which, though not ideal, proved to be adequate to the ask. A happenstance we hope not to repeat at a future conference on Paul within Paganism which will be a natural sequel to this project. Another way of continuing the advancement of Pauline scholarship.

Michael F. Bird

Easter Sunday, 9 April, 2023.

Table of Contents

| Preface | V |
|--|-----|
| Michael Bird An Introduction to the Paul within Judaism Debate | 1 |
| Karl-Wilhelm Niebuhr Agencies of Grace in Paul and James: Two Jewish Voices | 29 |
| Jörg Frey The Relativization of Ethnicity and Circumcision in Paul and His Communities | 45 |
| Joshua D. Garroway Messy Metaphors. Ethnic Transformation in Philo, Romans, and Ephesians | 63 |
| Brian Rosner Apostle from Israel to the Gentiles. The Jewish Roots of Paul's Identity and Mission | 75 |
| Chris Porter Which Paul? Whose Judaism? A Socio-Cognitive Approach to Paul within Judaism | 91 |
| David Starling "Those who were not my people". Paul's Gentile Churches and the Story of Israel | 107 |
| J. Brian Tucker and Wally V. Cirafesi Paul's Segmentary Grammar of Identity. Ex-Pagan Gentiles within Synagogues and the Importance of the Eschatological Pilgrimage Tradition | 119 |
| Ryan D. Collman For Who Has Known the Mind of the Apostle? Paul, the Law, and His Syngeneis in the Messiah | 147 |

| Abraham our Forefather and Herakles our Cousin. Paul's Genealogical Reasoning and Jewish Narratives of Belonging | 161 |
|---|--------------------------|
| Janelle Peters Paul and Synagogues | 187 |
| Ruben A. Bühner The Torah in Ethnically Mixed Assemblies. Paul's Behavioral Adaptability in 1 Cor 9:19–23 in Context of Jewish Pragmatism in the Diaspora | 201 |
| Joshua W. Jipp The Lukan Paul as Prophet of God's Resurrected Messiah. Prophecy and Messianism in the Lukan Depiction of Paul | 217 |
| Murray J. Smith The Theophany of the Resurrected Messiah. The "Jewish" Christology of Paul's Speeches in Acts | 235 |
| Lyn Kidson Remembering Paul in Asia Minor. A Contested Jewish Identity in the First Four Centuries of Christianity | 265 |
| Michael Kok The Heresiological Portrayals of the Ebionites and the Nazoraeans and Their Reception of Paul | 287 |
| List of Contributors | 313 315 351 361 |

An Introduction to the Paul within Judaism Debate

Michael Bird

1. The Persistence of Pauline Scholarship

I have spent a large part of my scholarly career as a Neutestamentler wrestling with the apostle Paul, his life, his letters, and his legacy. The reason for that is quite simple. The study of Paul is inescapable for anyone concerned with the New Testament, the origins of early Christianity, Greco-Roman religion, ancient Judaism, the development of Christian thought, or even the history of western civilization. Paul was unknown to the rich and powerful of his time, he was a divisive figure among those who did know him, and I doubt very much that anybody thought he was destined to become the towering figure of religious and intellectual history that he became. Yet here we are with another scholarly symposium about Paul, another collection of essays about him, and another set of debates and disagreements over him. This volume and the conference it was based on, is but another example of the continuing fascination with Paul in minds of scholars, people of all faiths and none, from different quarters of the globe, representing diverse streams of human experience, who are yet united by their abiding interest in Paul. The scholarship that examines Paul is both deep in its history and now relatively wide in the breadth of people who are drawn to the topic. Paul continues to have much significance for the academy, for those who specialize in the study of religion, and for living communities of faith.

What has become clear to me over the years is that "Paul" stands somewhere between a fragmented mosaic and a Rorschach drawing.

First, studying Paul is like brushing dust off a mosaic in an ancient Ephesian villa. The mosaic contains the face of a human figure and yet the mosaic contains gaps, a few cracked tiles, distortions of colour, and even some tiles that have been secondarily added to mosaic. We cannot and therefore do not see Paul as he really was, only as he was presented by the artist, and even that presentation is fragmentary. That is not to say we cannot see, understand, or know anything about Paul, but our knowledge of Paul is mediated as it is imperfect. The quest for the historical Paul is the quest for the Paul who is the most recoverable and plausible portrait of a historical figure of antiquity. Alas, we shall never find the holy grail that is Paul as his pure self, only Paul as apostle, author, and artwork, Paul as martyr and memory, Paul as a diaspora Jew and a symbol of Christian faith.

2 Michael Bird

Second, studying Paul is also like gazing at a Rorschach drawing. I say that because Paul is a figure read from history and read into history, a subject of exegesis and eisegesis, an extrapolation and a projection, someone other than us and a mirror of us. It is not exaggeration to say that every book about Paul tells you something about Paul and something about the researcher of Paul! A biography of Paul, an introduction to his letters, a description of his religion, or a summation of his thought, is never done in isolation from one's own biography, ones own proclivities, and one's own religious atmosphere. That is not to say that the study of Paul is purely a mirror, as if all we think we know about Paul is only what we project onto him. I don't believe the domain Pauline studies is reducible to an exercise in interpretive self-construction.

But it is incontestably true that the study of Paul is determined very much by context, the context that Paul is placed in, and the context that interpreters find themselves within. E.P. Sanders acknowledges that his own comparative study of Paul and Palestinian Judaism was not prescriptive. Palestinian Judaism simply provided the analogue against which Paul's own religious pattern could be compared. Sanders writes:

Lots of people think that ... somewhere in the pages of *Paul and Palestinian Judaism* there is a claim that Paul must be discussed only in the light of Jewish sources of Palestinian origin. There is no such claim: I merely compared him with the material that I had spent ten years studying.¹

Thus, to study Paul in the context Palestinian Judaism remains a choice and the choices are ample.

Thus, it makes an immense difference if one tries to situate Paul in the context of the Qumran scrolls, intra-Jewish sectarianism, itinerant philosophers, Greco-Roman associations, imperial cults, Plutarch's account of Hellenistic religion, Iranian Manicheanism, Jewish hekhalot traditions, new religious movements, millenarianism, or ancient accounts of gender and ethnicity. Similarly, it matters much if one studies Paul from the context of fifth century North African Christianity, a twelfth century Parisian monastery, intra-Protestant debates of the sixteenth century, among Indian civil rights lawyers in nineteenth century Delhi, in African-American churches in Atlanta in the 1960s, or in a Critical Theory class at Stanford University in the first quarter of the twenty-first century. Context shapes the purpose of study, the language of enquiry, and the results of research.

The meaning of Paul, that is, the coherences that we try to draw about him, are really the fusion of these ancient and modern contexts. Pauline scholarship consists of the backdrop we place Paul in combined with the lens we manufac-

¹ E.P. Sanders, "Between Judaism and Hellenism," in *Saint Paul among the Philosophers*, ed. Jack Caputa (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2009), 75.

ture to try to understand him. There are of course different ways of doing that, different ways of locating Paul and looking at Paul.

One could generalize that recent study of the apostle Paul and his letters breaks down into roughly five camps: Roman Catholic approaches, traditional Protestant interpretation, the New Perspective on Paul, the Apocalyptic Paul, and Paul within Judaism.² Yes, there are other tribes and trends too. Yes, these are not rigid divisions, each is diverse in its own way, but I think the generalization holds true.

2. Introducing Paul within Judaism

2.1 The Many Perspectives on Paul as Jewish and in Judaism

One recent trend in Pauline scholarship is known as Paul within Judaism, which is a collection of scholars committed to the project of studying Paul in his Jewish context. So rather than speak merely of Paul and Judaism, they are inclined to speak of Paul's Judaism.3 Most commonly, Paul is described as a Jewish figure, addressing Jewish concerns, engaged in Jewish moral, cultic, and scriptural reasonings with a view to attaining a better gasp of Paul in comparative religious history. By situating Paul within Judaism, proponents appear to mean studying the apostle Paul and his letters in relationship to the Jewish people and cultus, reconsidering Paul's Jewish identity and his own Jewish devotion, reassessing the relationship of Paul's Gentile Messiah-believing converts to Jewish communities, and (in some cases) seeking to cultivate better inter-religious relationships between Jews and Christians. It means too, put negatively, avoiding the anachronism of thinking of Paul as a "Christian" theologian, stripping away caricatures of Judaism as a "religion" of "legalism" or "ethnocentrism," undermining the presupposition that sets Paul's discourse against Jews and Judaism, and exposing anti-Jewish perspectives in Pauline scholarship. The "Paul within Judaism" movement (PwJ) - we cannot call it a faction or school - bears these general characteristics, though it has its own internal diversities.

The PwJ network of scholars is not a thunderbolt out of the blue, there are precursors and forerunners. There has been a long history of Jewish intellectuals wrestling with Paul as a figure of Jewish antiquity and as an agent of Chris-

² Cf. Michael F. Bird, ed., Four Views on the Apostle Paul (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2012); N.T. Wright, Paul and His Recent Interpreters (London: SPCK, 2015); Scot McKnight and B.J. Oropeza, eds., Perspectives on Paul: Five Views (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2020); Ben Witherington and Jason A. Myers, Voices and Views on Paul: Exploring Scholarly Trends (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2020).

³ Cf. Mark D. Nanos, "Paul and Judaism: Why Not Paul's Judaism?" in *Paul Unbound: Other Perspectives on the Apostle*, ed. Mark D. Given (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2010), 117–60.

4 Michael Bird

tian anti-Semitism.⁴ One can see important pioneers in the studies of William D. Davies and Johannes Munck who were among the first scholars in the post Shoah era to reconsider Paul as a consistently Jewish figure.⁵ In addition, a very underappreciated figure is Markus Barth, son of the great Swiss Theologian Karl Barth. Barth the younger argued for rethinking Paul's *Jewishness* and reframing Jewish-Christian inter-faith relations in such a way that was decades ahead of its time. For Barth, Paul's account of "justification by faith" was not a polemical doctrine, but an ecumenical one, Paul's attempt to unite rather than divide Jewish and Gentile Christians. In addition, Barth believed that it was possible to envisage Paul, even saint Paul, as a "good Jew." What was required to do that was for Christian theologians to forfeit their superiority complex and supersessionist impulses as well as reject condescending and caricatured views of Jewish legalism. Barth's contention, banally self-evident as it might sound now, was revolutionary back in 1960s and 70s, i.e., the apostle Paul needs to be rethought and even reclaimed as Jewish thinker. Further, a corollary of a Jewish re-imagining of Paul was that inter-faith ecumenical relationships between Jews and Christians need to be refreshed.

⁴ Cf. Donald A. Hagner, "Paul in Modern Jewish Thought," in *Pauline Studies*, ed. Donald A. Hagner and Murray J. Harris (FS F.F. Bruce; Exeter: Paternoster, 1980), 143-65; Stefan Meißner, Die Heimholung des Ketzers: Studien zur jüdischen Auseinandersetzung mit Paulus, WUNT 2/87 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1996); William D. Davies, "Paul: from the Jewish Point of View," in The Cambridge History of Judaism: Volume 3 - The Early Roman Period, ed. William Horbury, William D. Davies, and John Sturdy (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 3.678-730; Sung-Hee Lee-Linke, ed., Paulus der Jude: Seine Stellung im christlich-jüdischen Dialog heute (Frankfurt a. M.: Lembeck, 2005); Michael F. Bird and Preston Sprinkle, "Jewish Interpretation of Paul in the Last Thirty Years," CBR 6 (2008): 355-76; Daniel R. Langton, The Apostle Paul in the Jewish Imagination: A Study in Modern Jewish-Christian Relations (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010); John Gager, "The Rehabilitation of Paul in Jewish Tradition," in 'The One Who Sows Bountifully': Essays in Honor of Stanley K. Stowers, ed. Caroline J. Hodge, Saul M. Olyan, Daniel Ullicci, and Emma Wasserman (Providence, RI: Brown Judaic Studies, 2013), 29-41; Patrick Gray, Paul as a Problem of History and Culture: The Apostle and His Critics Through the Centuries (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2016), 117-41.

⁵ William D. Davies, *Paul and Rabbinic Judaism: Some Rabbinic Elements in Pauline Theology* (London: SPCK, 1948) and Johannes Munck, *Paul and the Salvation of Mankind* (London: SCM, 1959); idem, *Christ and Israel: An Interpretation of Romans 9–11* (Philadelphia, PA: Fortress, 1967).

⁶ Markus Barth, "Jews and Gentiles: The Social Character of Justification in Paul," *JES* 5 (1968): 241-67.

⁷ Markus Barth, "Der gute Jude Paulus," in *Richte unsere Füße auf den Weg des Friedens*, ed. Andreas Baudis, Dieter Clausert, Volkhard Schliski, and Bernhard Wegener, FS Helmut Gollwitzer (München: Christian Kaiser, 1979), 107–37; repr. "St. Paul – A Good Jew," *HBT* 1 (1979): 7–45. See reflections on Markus Barth's article by Stanley E. Porter, "Was Paul a Good Jew? Fundamental Issues in a Current Debate," in *Christian-Jewish Relations Through the Centuries*, ed. Stanley E. Porter and Brook W.R. Pearson, JSNTSup 192 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 2000), 148–74.

The cluster of scholarship called "The New Perspective on Paul" (NPP), associated with luminaries such as E.P. Sanders, James D.G. Dunn, N.T. Wright, Terence Donaldson, and Bruce Longenecker among others was an important precursor to PwJ.8 The NPP largely accepted Sanders' view that first century Palestinian Judaism was not a religion of works-righteousness, a type of moralistic legalism, but expressed what Sanders called "covenantal nomism," a salvific scheme typified by an efficacious divine election and means of covenantal grace. But, if Judaism was not legalistic as Protestants had imagined, a legalism for which Paul's gospel of grace was the antithesis and antidote, then what did Paul find wrong with Judaism? Sanders' answer was that in Paul's mind the problem was that Judaism was not "Christianity," it had not experienced or embraced God's revelation of salvation in the Messiah. Yet that was considered too simplistic an explanation. Instead, it was argued, that Paul's problem was not a lack of grace in Judaism, but a belief that God's grace was reserved only for Jews to the exclusion of Gentiles. In other words, the problem was not legalism but trusting in a "national righteousness," an "ethnocentric covenantalism," or an "ethnocentric nomism," that is, clinging to the Jewish way of life as codified in the Torah, summed up as righteousness by "works of the law."

The gain of the NPP was that Paul was now studied as a figure within Judaism, not as a Protestant tackling medieval anxieties about how to find a merciful God, nor attacking synergistic and sacramental theologies of salvation, and not an existentialist philosopher on a quest for authenticity. Paul was not interested in the question of whether justification entailed an imputation of Jesus's active obedience by faith alone in opposition to an infusion of grace to energize believers to work out their faith in charitable deeds. Rather, Paul was dealing with Jewish questions: Do Gentiles have to become Jews in order to be followers of Jesus? How do Christ-believing Jews and Gentiles inhabit the same spaces, eat at the same tables, worship in the same tenement when Gentiles have regarded the Jews as misanthropists and Jews have regarded Gentiles as polluted with ignorance, idolatry, immorality, and impurity? The NPP made better sense historically, and it operated on the premise that Paul was not against the Jewish

⁸ Cf. Hans Hübner, "Zur gegenwärtigen Diskussion über die Theologie des Paulus," *JBTh* 7 (1992): 399–413; Kent L. Yinger, *The New Perspective on Paul: An Introduction* (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2011); Michael F. Bird, *The Saving Righteousness of God: Studies on Paul, Justification, and the New Perspective* (Milton Keynes, UK: Paternoster, 2007), 88–154; Garwood P. Anderson, *Paul's New Perspective: Charting a Soteriological Journey* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2016).

⁹ Or as E.P. Sanders (*Paul: The Apostles' Life, Letters, and Thought* [Minneapolis, MN: Fortress, 2015], 8–9 put it: "The major theological battle of his career was whether or not gentiles (non-Jews) who accepted Jesus must also become Jewish by being circumcised and accepting other parts of the Jewish law that separated Jew from gentile. Paul argued vociferously that his converts could remain gentiles, though they had to accept Jewish monotheism and most aspects of Jewish ethics."

6 Michael Bird

religion as much as he was transforming it around a particular story of Israel's Messiah.¹⁰

That is not to say that the NPP did not have its own failings or shortcomings. 11 To begin with, Sanders himself was operating with a liberal Protestant view whereby a religion of grace is eminently better than one of merit; yet that constituted a theological judgment, not a historical one. Plus, Sanders had reiterated the discontinuity between Paul and Judaism by postulating that Paul had replaced "covenantal nomism" with "participation in Christ." In addition, Jewish soteriologies of the Persian, Hellenistic, Second Temple, and Rabbinic periods were not monolithic, there were "variegated" understandings of the purpose of Torah-observance and different "efficacies" as to the nature of divine grace. 12 It is hazardous to over-generalize as to the substance, scope, and instrument of salvation among all Jews and Jewish literature. There was also the danger that the NPP reduced Paul's account of righteousness or justification to a socio-epiphenomenon of in-group identity status and negated the apocalyptic and theocentric texture of Paul's whereby a believer's status vis-à-vis God and the final judgment was at stake. There was also a caricatured dismissal of the Medieval and Reformed traditions as misreaders of Paul rather than appreciating them in their own right as part of the trajectory of Pauline reception. 13 Fi-

¹⁰ Cf. e.g., James D.G. Dunn, *Beginning from Jerusalem*, CITM 2 (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2009), 522–30; N.T. Wright, *Paul and the Faithfulness of God*, COQG 4 (London: SPCK, 2014), 1407–72.

¹¹ Cf. e.g., A. Andrew Das, Paul, the Law, and the Covenant (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2004); Bird, The Saving Righteousness of God, 88–112; idem, An Anomalous Jew: Paul among Jews, Greeks, and Romans (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2016), 20; Anderson, Paul's New Perspective, 15–56; Kathy Ehrensperger, Search Paul: Conversations with the Jewish Apostle to the Nations, WUNT 429 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2019), 353–75.

¹² Cf. Mark A. Elliott, The Survivors of Israel: A Reconsideration of the Theology of Pre-Christian Judaism (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2000), 245-307; Donald A. Carson, "Summaries and Conclusions," in Justification and Variegated Nomism, vol. 1: The Complexities of Second Temple Judaism, ed. Donald A. Carson, Peter T. O'Brien, and Mark Seifrid (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2001), 543-8; Bird, Saving Righteousness, 93-4, 179-94; Watson, Paul, Judaism, and the Gentiles, xvii, 12-9; A. Andrew Das, "Paul and the Law: Pressure Points in the Debate," in Paul Unbound: Other Perspectives on the Apostle, ed. Mark D. Given (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2010), 99-116, here 101; Daniel M. Gurtner, ed., This World and the World to Come: Soteriology in Early Judaism, LSTS 74 (London: T&T Clark, 2011); Gabriele Boccaccini, "Inner-Jewish Debate on the Tension between Divine and Human Agency in Second Temple Judaism," in Divine and Human Agency in Paul and His Cultural Development, ed. John M.G. Barclay and Simon G. Gathercole (London: T&T Clark, 2007), 9-26; Preston M. Sprinkle, Paul and Judaism Revisited: A Study of Divine and Human Agency in Salvation (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2013), 208-38; Jacob Thiessen, Gottes Gerechtigkeit und Evangelium im Römerbrief: Die Rechtfertigungslehre des Paulus im Vergleich zu antiken jüdischen Auffassungen und zur neuen Paulusperspektive (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2014), 112-37; David Lincicum, Ruth Sheridan, and Charles M. Stang, eds., Law and Lawlessness in Early Judaism and Early Christianity, WUNT 420 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2019); John M.G. Barclay, Paul and the Gift (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2017).

¹³ Cf. Stephen Westerholm, Perspectives Old and New on Paul: The "Lutheran" Paul and

nally, one could also argue that the NPP continued with the Christian tradition of essentializing Judaism, that is, reducing Judaism to the negative foil for Paul's gospel, with the exception that the NPP had replaced Jewish "legalism" with Jewish "nationalism." The Jews remained the villains and are directly or indirectly vilified as opponents of Paul, Paul's Christ, and Paul's God.

Some, however, taking their cue from the NPP, wanted to go further, and argue that Paul himself had no contention with Jews and Judaism. Paul's gospel was about messianic salvation for Gentiles, a gospel which left the Jewish covenant and Jewish way of life completely intact, without any need for conversion or consolation. Such a view was initially identified as the "Radical Paul" (RP) since the RP represented a more radicalized approach to reimagining a Jewish Paul. To give one example, John Gager argues that for Paul, "The law remains in effect for who are circumcised." In fact, "Paul's affirmation of the law's continued validity for Israel" means that there can be no "End-time conversion of Israel to Christ." Paul does not envisage a *Sonderweg* for Israel, for the Jewish covenant remains effective. To the contrary, what Paul "taught and preached" says Gager, "was instead a special path, a *Sonderweg*, for Gentiles." ¹⁴

The RP never really caught on or displaced the NPP as the resident paradigm for Pauline studies to rival traditional Protestant and Catholic interpretations. That said, out of the NPP and RP was birthed the PwJ network. PwJ can be viewed, in some ways, as a follow-up to the NPP, or else as a mopping up exercise to dot the "i's" and cross the "t's" and correct a few motifs that the NPP mistook. PwJ is perhaps the NPP with a kippah!¹⁵

2.2 Paul within Judaism: A Preliminary Appreciation

PwJ is among the most exciting and controversial avenues for studying Paul because it is testing many old assumptions and positing fresh proposal on Paul vis-à-vis Judaism. There is no single manifesto or definitive publication of its aims or ambitions. ¹⁶ I'd aver that above all, PwJ is marked out by the claim that

His Critics (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2003); Michael Bachmann and Johannes Woyke, eds., Lutherische und neue Paulusperspektive: Beiträge zu einem Schlüsselproblem der gegenwärtigen exegetischen Diskussion, WUNT 182 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005); Stephen J. Chester, Reading Paul with the Reformers: Reconciling Old and New Perspectives (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2017).

¹⁴ John G. Gager, Reinventing Paul (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 146.

¹⁵ According to Ehrensperger (*Searching Paul*, 373) what the NPP, RP, and PwJ share is interest in plotting the social position and theological identity of Paul's Christ-following groups.

¹⁶ Note should be taken of Paula Fredriksen's contributions, *Paul: The Pagans' Apostle* (New Haven, CN: Yale University Press, 2017); idem, "What Does It Mean to See Paul 'within Judaism," *JBL* 141 (2022): 359–80. A few edited collections by Mark D. Nanos and Magnus Zetterholm, eds., *Paul within Judaism: Restoring the First-Century Context to the Apostle* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress, 2015); Gabriele Boccaccini and Carlos A. Segovia, eds., *Paul the Jew: Rereading the Apostle as a Figure of Second Temple Judaism* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress,

8 Michael Bird

Paul's Jewishness and Judaism are neither tacit nor token, neither theoretical nor formal, but lay at the core of his identity, mission, and something he practiced even as a Messiah-confessor. Beyond that axiom several other claims and insights stand out.

First, PwJ scholars are freshly probing the meaning of Ἰουδαῖος ("Jew/Judean") and Ἰουδαϊσμός ("Judaism").

To begin with, there is the extant debate as to whether Ἰουδαῖος should be treated as an ethnic, religious, or geographical identifier (or a mixture thereof). While the translation "Judean" gained favor for a time, and in some contexts is an appropriate translation, 18 there is a general recognition now that "Jew" might be preferable given that Ἰουδαῖος communicates a mixture of common ancestry and shared custom which transcends the geographical confines of Judea. 19

In addition, there is a recognition that Ἰουδαϊσμός means the Jewish/Judean way of life. ²⁰ The complicating fact is that Judaism was of course diverse, some even prefer to speak of "Judaisms" in the plural, a semantic innovation made from observing the pluriformity of Jewish communities and practices even if "Judaisms" is an ultimately unsatisfying nomenclature. ²¹ In any case, there were

^{2016);} František Ábel, ed., *The Message of Paul the Apostle within Second Temple Judaism* (Lanham: Lexington, 2020). Useful summaries are Mark D. Nanos, "A Jewish View," in *Four Views on the Apostle Paul*, ed. Michael F. Bird (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2012), 159–92 and Magnus Zetterholm, "The Paul within Judaism Perspective," in *Perspectives on Paul: Five Views*, ed. Scot McKnight and B.J. Oropeza (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2020), 171–218.

¹⁷ See survey in David M. Miller, "Ethnicity, Religion, and the Meaning of *Ioudaios* in Ancient 'Judaism," CBR 12 (2014): 216–65; and more recent discussion in Jason A. Staples, The Idea of Israel in Second Temple Judaism: A New Theory of People, Exile, and Israelite Identity (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021), 11–21; Matthew V. Novenson, Paul Then and Now (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2022), 25–31.

¹⁸ Cf. e.g., Philip F. Esler, Conflict and Identity in Romans: The Social Setting of Paul's Letter (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress, 2003), 63–74; Steve Mason, "Jews, Judaeans, Judaizing, Judaism: Problems of Categorization in Ancient History," JSJ 38 (2007): 457–512; Steve Mason and Philip F. Esler, "Judean and Christ-Follower Identities: Grounds for a Distinction," NTS 62 (2016): 439–60.

¹⁹ John M. G. Barclay, Jews in the Mediterranean Diaspora: From Alexander to Trajan (323 BCE-117 CE) (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1996), 404; Michael F. Bird, Crossing over Sea and Land: Jewish Missionary Activity in the Second Temple Period (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2010), 13-6; idem, An Anomalous Jew, 47-8.
²⁰ BDAG, 479.

²¹ According to J. Andrew Overman (Church and Community in Crisis: The Gospel according to Matthew [Valley Forge, PA: TPI, 1996], 9): "So varied was Jewish society in the land of Israel in this period, and so varied were the Jewish groups, that scholars no longer speak of Judaism in the singular when discussing this formative and fertile period in Jewish history. Instead, we speak about Judaisms. In this time and place, there existed a number of competing, even rival Judaisms." However, James C. Vanderkam ("Judaism in the Land of Israel," in Early Judaism: A Comprehensive Overview, ed. John J. Collins and Daniel C. Harlow [Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2012], 70–94, here 91) rejects the language of "Judaisms" because: "The surviving evidence exhibits a richness and diversity in the Judaism of the Second Temple era, a diversity so great that some have resorted to the neologism 'Judaisms' to express it. Yet, despite the undoubted diversity present in the texts, there are fundamental

different ways of adhering to and living out Jewishness in Judea and the Diaspora. In addition, in Christian interpretation, the term "Judaism" has become defined as the negative foil or anti-thesis to Christianity. In other words, "Judaism" was "invented" to be the darkness against which the luminous brightness of Pauline grace shone so brightly. We can certainly contest or qualify any attempt to provide a simplistic account of the "parting of the ways" between Christianity and Judaism, just as we need caution as to the reification of Jewishness and Christian-ness as discreet identities. The PwJ claim is that the juxtaposition of Judaism and Christianity as distinct and even competing religions owes much to (mis)readings of Paul rather than something intended by Paul, misreadings that need to be corrected.

This is why one of the most significant passages to draw attention in PwJ scholarship is Gal 1:13–14 where Paul narrates to the Galatians, "You have heard of my former way of life in Judaism" (Ἡκούσατε γὰρ τὴν ἐμὴν ἀναστροφήν ποτε ἐν τῷ Ἰουδαϊσμῷ). What is Paul contrasting here? Does Paul contrast his former way of life in Judaism with his current way of life as a Christ-follower that is post-Judaism? Or, does Paul contrast his former way in Judaism with his current way of life in Judaism as a Christ-follower? Given Paul's commitment to Torah, monotheism, avoiding idolatry, affirming Israel's eschatological hopes, messianic devotion, and immersing Gentile in such things, it makes no sense to speak of his abandonment of Judaism. Ponetheless, Paul does make a sharp and jarring contrast between his former and current modes of life with respect to Judaism. Perhaps the solution is that Paul here means "Judaism" is a particular sense, not as his dislocation from or denunciation of the entire ethno-reli-

beliefs and practices that would have been accepted by virtually all Jews during those centuries and that justify retaining the singular noun Judaism." See also E.P. Sanders, "Common Judaism Explored," in *Common Judaism: Explorations in Second-Temple Judaism*, ed. Wayne O. McCready and Adele Reinhartz (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2008), 11–23, on balancing unity and diversity in ancient Judaism.

²² See esp. Ignatius, *Phild*. 6.1; *Magn*. 8.1; 10.3. While Justin Martyr's *Dialogues with Try-pho* does not use the term "Judaism," nonetheless, Justin's presentation of the Jewish tradition is as a precursor and preparation for the gospel, while also obsolete and even superseded by Christian faith. See Daniel Boyarin, "Justin Martyr Invents Judaism," *Church History* 70 (2001): 427–61; idem, "Why Ignatius Invented Judaism," in *The Ways that Often Parted: Essays in Honor of Joel Marcus*, ed. Lori Baron, Jill Hicks-Keeton, and Matthew Thiessen (Atlanta, GA: SBL, 2008), 309–24.

²³ On such cautions, see Annette Yoshiko Reed, *Jewish-Christianity and the History of Judaism*, TSAJ 171 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2018), 82-4.

²⁴ See discussion in Susan D. Eastman, Recovering Paul's Mother Tongue: Language and Theology in Galatians (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2007), 33–43; Markus Cromhout, "Paul's 'Former Conduct in the Judean Way of Life' (Gal 1:13) ... or Not?" HTSTS 63 (2009): 1–12; David Rudoph, A Jew to the Jews: Jewish Contours of Pauline Flexibility in 1 Corinthians 9:19–23 (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2016), 44–6; Daniel Boyarin, "Ioudaismos within Paul: A Modified Reading of Gal 1:13–14," in Abel, The Message of Paul, 167–78.

²⁵ Rightly Novenson, Paul Then and Now, 47-50.

10 Michael Bird

gion of the Jews, but as referring to his dereliction of a zealous and fanatical mode of Judaism, the Pharisaic tradition. ²⁶ It was this zealous Judeanism which drove his persecution of the churches, who were in his mind, a rogue messianic cult, ²⁷ who were lowering the currency of Israel's election and contaminating Israel's capacity to worship God in holiness by fraternizing with Gentiles and by venerating Jesus in unusually intense ways. In other words, what Paul rejects is a post-Maccabean species of sectarian Judaism typified by its zeal for national holiness and pharisaic *halakhah*. ²⁸ Whatever solution is preferred, such texts are ground zero in PwJ to wrestle with Paul's Jewish identity as well as his many aggravated denials and relentless affirmations with respect to his Christ-following devotion.

PwJ scholarship, therefore, attempts to explore Paul's language of Ἰουδαῖος and Ἰουδαϊσμός with greater lexical precision, informed by ancient notions of ethnicity and religious identity, and without the baggage of essentializing Jews and Judaism as the anti-type to Christianity.

Second, PwJ scholars take it as axiomatic that Paul himself was Torah-observant. Paul strenuously rejects the imposition of Torah observance upon Gentiles, especially circumcision and food laws, yet never implies that Jews should cease from observing the Torah.²⁹ As such, Paul's remarks that the Torah is not nullified but upheld by faith in Christ are taken seriously (Rom 3:31). Paul negates the need for proselytism for Gentiles to be Christ-followers, that is, he rejects compelling them to judaize to the point of circumcision (see Josephus, *Bell.* 2.454) as part of allegiance to Christ (Rom 3:21–4:25; 1 Cor 7:18–20; Gal 5:1–11; 6:12–16) and as the condition for table fellowship in the church (Gal 2:1–21).³⁰ While Paul would not permit Titus to be circumcised under duress (Gal 2:3), yet the Lucan Paul consented for Timothy to be circumcised which sounds plausible enough (Acts 16:1–3). An interesting qualification is that Paul does in

²⁶ Paul as a Jewish Christ-believing convert speaks of "Judaism" the same way an ex-Muslim Christian might speak of "Jihadism." Not all Judaism is about zealous and pharisaic traditions just as not all of Islam is about jihad.

²⁷ E. P. Sanders, Paul: The Apostles' Life, Letters, and Thought, 194–5, 494.

²⁸ See Francis Watson, *Paul, Judaism, and the Gentiles: Beyond the New Perspective*, rev. ed. (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2007), 22–4; Matthew V. Novenson, "Paul's Former Occupation in *Ioudaismos*," in *Galatians and Christian Theology: Justification, the Gospel, and Ethics in Paul's Letter*, ed. Mark W. Elliott, Scott J. Hafemann, and N.T. Wright (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2014), 24–39; Boyarin, "*Ioudaismos* within Paul," 173–5.

²⁹ See Karl-Wilhelm Niebuhr, "Offene Fragen zur Gesetzespraxis bei Paulus und seinen Gemeinden (Sabbat, Speisegebote, Beschneidung)," *BThZ* 25 (2008): 16–51.

³⁰ Whether Gentiles had to be circumcisioned in order to "convert" to Judaism was a matter of considerable contention even among Jewish communities. Josephus's account of the conversion/circumcision of King Izates of Adiabene is case in point (*Ant.* 20.34–48) and backgrounds the discussion of Gentile circumcision in Acts 15, Galatians 2–5, and Romans 1–4. On which, see Bird, *Crossing Over Sea and Land*, 97–9 and Matthew Thiessen, *Contesting Conversion: Genealogy, Circumcision, and Identity in Ancient Judaism and Christianity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011).

Index of Modern Authors

Ábel, František 8–9, 15–16, 138, 141, 148 Bauer, Dieter 204, 267 Bauer, Walter 153, 267-268 Abrahams, Israel 308 Adams, Sean A. 251 Baumann, Gerd 121-123, 125, 127 Adna, Jostein 238 Baumgartner, Walter 204 Aernie, Jeffrey W. 80 Baur, Ferdinand Christian 50, 287-288, Akiyama, Kengo 158 291 Alexander, Haslam 95 Bauspieß, Martin 37 Alexander, Philip S. 147–149, 160 Bavinck, Herman 251 Alexander, T. Desmond 83 Beale, Gregory K. 116, 120, 258 Beasley-Murray, George R. 248, 261, 267 Allison, Dale C. 29, 34, 227 Alston, Richard 269 Beatrice, Pier Franco 294, 300, 306 Alvares, Jean 196 Beck, Johannes U. 37 Anderson, Garwood P. 5-6 Becker, Adam H. 154 Becker, Eve-Marie M. 31, 46 Anderson, K. L. 236 Becker, Jürgen 45, 75 Applegate, Judith 191, 194-195 Arendt, Hannah 162 Beers, Holly 228 Ascough, Richard 189 Belleville, Linda L 156 Auler, Samuel 143 Ben-Smit, Peter 293 Aune, David. E. 267 Berger, David 159 Auwers, Jean-Marie 30 Bernier, John 197 Berthelot, Katell 66, 68-69, 174, 176 Baasland, Ernst 109 Bieringer, Reimund 76 Binder, Donald D. 131-132, 140 Bachmann, Michael 7 Baker, Coleman A. 127 Bird, Michael F. 1, 3–6, 8, 10–11, 17–19, Baker, Cynthia M. 261 21, 76, 119–120, 124, 128–129, 144, 254, Baker, John A. 289 293, 294 Bitner, Bradley J. 268 Bakke, Odd Magne 269 Balabansky, Vicky 310 Blaschke, Andreas 58, 60 Baltzer, Klaus 222 Blenkinsopp, Joseph 253 Bammel, Ernst 255 Boccaccini, Gabriele 6-7, 16, 113, 152, Barclay, John M. G. 6, 8, 15, 52, 96-97, 210, 236, 253, 255, 261 99, 197, 202, 207, 269–270, 272 Bock, Darrell L. 70, 248-249 Böckler, Annette 35 Barker, Joel D. 247 Baron, Lori 9 Bockmuehl, Markus 15, 150 Boda, Mark J. 247 Barraclaugh, Ray 199

Boin, Douglas 275, 277-278

Boring, M. E. 45, 190, 287

Bovon, François 152, 231, 260

Bond, H. K. 30

Bonnie, Rick 131

Borgen, Peder 86

Barrett, Charles K. 101, 255, 264

Bauckham, Richard J. 144, 235, 246, 258,

289, 290–291, 294, 300–303, 307

Barth, Markus 4

Baudis, Andreas 4

Bates, Matthew W. 241

Bowersock, G.W. 52 Boyarin, Daniel 9, 10, 30, 153, 189, 261, 276, 296, 305, 309 Brandon, S. G. F. 310 Brawley, Robert L. 122 Bremmer, Jan N. 255 Breytenbach, Cilliers 46, 207, 235, 265, 280, 282 Broadhead, Edwin K. 289-294, 297-298, 302-307, 310 Brock, Ann Graham 231 Brooten, Bernadette J. 198 Brown, Peter 52 Brown, Rupert 94 Bruce, F. F. 4, 110, 241, 248, 251, 258 Buckwalter, Douglas 243 Buell, Denise Kimber 50, 62, 64, 271 Bühner, Ruben A. 26, 46, 147, 151, 201, 203, 205, 240-241, 261 Bultmann, Rudolf 14, 46 Burke, Trevor J. 80 Burnett, David A. 156 Burris, Catherine 281 Burton, Ernest DeWitt 110 Bush, Frederic W. 205 Butterworth, G.W. 268 Butticaz, Simon 48, 50, 52, 57 Byrne, Shannon 196 Byron, John 180

Calder, William M. 265 Campbell, William S. 16, 120, 125, 127, 131, 183 Capes, David B. 235, 246 Carraway, George 251 Carroll, John T. 113 Carson, Donald A. 6, 77, 83, 116, 254, 258 Casey, Thomas G. 17 Cefalu, Rita F. 238 Cerone, Jacob 157 Charlesworth, James H. 87, 248, 253 Chester, Andrew 159 Chester, Stephen J. 7, 285 Churchill, Timothy W.R. 244, 255, 259 Ciampa, Roy E. 80, 83, 88, 101, 102 Cirafesi, Wally V. 24, 119, 130-131, 139 Clarke, Andrew D. 127

Clausert, Dieter 4 Cohen, Boaz 196 Cohen, Shaye J. D. 53, 65, 93, 137, 169, 173-174, 189 Cohick, Lynn H. 70 Collins, Adela Y. 198 Collins, John J. 8, 20, 52, 84, 87, 148, 206, 241 Collman, Ryan D. 25, 100, 147, 150–151 Cologny, Bodmer 281 Colson F. H. 34, 36, 68, 73 Concannon, Cavan 51, 64 Cosgrove, Charles H. 50, 52, 54-55, 61, Cover, Michael B. 30 Croasmun, Matthew 18 Cromhout, Markus 9 Crossley, James 98 Crouch, James E. 260 Crowe, Brandon D. 236, 240-241 Cueva, Edmund P. 196 Cuthbert, Denise 104

Danielou, Jean 289, 291, 299-302 Dann, Rachael J. 52 Darko, Daniel K. 64 Das, A. Andrew 6, 107, 109, 139 Davies, Stephen J. 281 Davies, William D. 4, 53, 61, 159 De Arellano, Adriana Ramirez 122-123 De Boer, Martinus 107–109, 193, 289, 291, 304–305, 307 De Vos, J. Cornelis 158 Dean, O. C. 45 Decker, Wolfgang 207 Delling, Gerhard 207 DelRio, Delio 130 Dettwiler, Andreas 48 Dicken, Frank 243 Dickson, John P. 82-83 Dochhorn, Jan 34 Donaldson, Terence L. 5, 61, 79, 80, 120, 136, 140, 141 Doody, Cameron J. 113, 152 Dryden, John 187 Du Toit, Philip La Grange 139 Dumont, Louis 123

Dunn, James D. G. 5–6, 47, 50, 75–76, 85, 114, 285 Dunne, John A. 19 Dunning, Benjamin H. 64, 70 Dunson, Ben C. 121 Dzino, Danijel 92–93

Earnest, Evans 280 Eastman, Susan Grove 9, 110, 111 Eckhardt, Benedikt 168-170, 172 Edsall, Benjamin 281 Edwards, James R. 294, 300-301, 306 Ehrensperger, Kathy 6-7, 19, 25, 122, 129, 144, 148, 150, 161, 182, 205 Ehrlich, Uri 197 Eisenbaum, Pamela 12, 46, 129, 150, 209, Elliott, Mark A. 6, 10, 93 Elmer, Ian J. 194 Engberg-Pedersen, Troels 156 Engel, David 159 Eschner, Christina 202-203, 205-206 Esler, Phillip 8, 92, 125–126 Evans, Craig A. 244 Evans-Pritchard, Edward E. 122-123 Exell, Karen 52 Eyl, Jennifer 99

Fee, Gordon D. 214, 241 Feldman, Louis H. 202, 207 Feldmeier, Reinhard 34–35 Ferda, Tucker S. 240 Fisch, Yael 157 Fitzmyer, Joseph A. 251, 258–260 Fludernik, Monika 162 Flusser, David 158 Fox, Kenneth A. 267 Fréchet, Robyn 289 Fredriksen, Paula 7, 11–12, 16, 47–48, 64-65, 68, 101, 105, 129, 134, 136, 138–140, 142, 147, 156, 174, 177, 183, 208–209, 212, 217, 235, 246, 262–264, 288 Freidenreich, David M. 202 Frey, Jörg 22–23, 31, 45–46, 48, 50, 55, 75, 87, 128, 147, 157, 201, 235, 295, 306 Furnish, V. P. 86 Furstenberg, Yair 52

Gaffin, Richard B. 241, 254 Gager, John 4, 7, 46–47, 98, 287–288 Garrett, Matthew 162 Garroway, Joshua D. 14-15, 17, 23, 63 - 65Gary, Gilbert 242 Gasparini, Valentino 174 Gaston, Lloyd 19, 47 Gathercole, Simon G. 6, 241 Gaventa, Beverly Roberts 156 Geary, Patrrick J. 52 Georgi, Dieter 143-144 Gieschen, Charles A. 244, 255, 257-258, Gingrich, André 121–123, 125, 127 Given, Mark D. 3, 6 Glöckner, Michael 34 Goldingay, John E. 203-204 Goldsworthy, Graeme 83 Gollwitzer, FS Helmut 4 Goulder, Michael D. 287-288, 290, 293-294 Grabar, Oleg 52 Gray, Patrick 4 Gregory, Andrew F. 289, 290–291, 295, 301, 305-309 Grenholm, Cristina 123 Grindheim, Sigurd 256 Gripentrog, Stefanie 45, 75, 128, 201 Gruen, Erich S. 49, 52, 164, 166, 207 Gundry-Volf, Judith 61 Gupta, Nijay K. 235 Gurtner, Daniel M. 6

Hafemann, Scott J. 10
Hagner, Donald A. 4, 210
Häkkinen, Sakari 152, 290–291,
293–295, 297, 299–303
Hakola, Raimo 131
Hall, Jonathan M. 51–52
Hamm, Dennis 232
Hanges, James C. 76
Harding, Mark 268, 277
Hare, Douglas A. 288
Harland, Philip A. 132, 267
Harlow, Daniel C. 8, 20, 84
Harnack, Adolf von 50, 267
Harrill Albert J. 64

Harrington, Hannah 170 Harris, Harrold A. 207 Harris, Murray J. 4, 251 Harrison, James R. 162 Haslam, S. Alexander 95 Hayes, Christine Elizabeth 88, 156–158, 160, 170 Hays, Richard B. 78, 87, 109, 113, 243, 253 Hedberg, Mitch 63 Heike, Kämpf 162 Heil, John Paul 113 Heinsch, Ryan 142-143 Heiser, Michael S. 246 Heliso, Desta 253 Hengel, Martin 55 Henze, Matthias 261 Heron, Helen S. 45 Herzer, Jens 271, 274-275 Hezser, Catherine 148 Hicks-Keeton, Jill 9 Hieke, Thomas 206 Hilgenfeld, Adolf 287-288, 290-291, 302 Himmelfarb, Martha 170 Hirsch-Luipold, Rainer 34 Hock, Richard F. 129 Hodge, Carolyn Johnson 4, 50-51, 62, 64-65, 179, 208, 271 Hofius, Otfried 61 Honigman, Sylvie 52, 164 Hooker, Morna D. 76, 109 Horbury, William T. 4, 53, 61, 256, 309 Horn, Friedrich W. 26, 46, 56 Horrell, David G. 49, 64, 84, 93 Horst, Pieter W. Van der 309 Hubbard, Benjamin 227 Hübner, Hans 5 Hultgren, Arland J. 81 Humphrey, Edith M. 206 Hurtado, Larry W. 39, 46, 235, 244, 251 Hutchington, John 51-52 Hutson, Christopher R. 273 Hvalvik, Reidar 149, 152-53, 210, 289, 290

Ilan, Tal 134 Instone-Brewer, David 197 Jackson-McCabe, Matt 37, 149, 153
Jacobs, Andrew S. 284
Janowski, Bernd 238
Jenkins, Richard 51
Jervell, Jacob 152, 217, 221, 242, 262
Jewett, Robert 113
Jipp, Joshua W. 26–27, 127, 147, 152, 217, 228–229, 237, 253, 261–262
Johansson, Daniel 243
Johnson, E. Elizabeth 113
Johnson, Luke Timothy 219, 230, 232
Jones, Sian 51
Jones, Stanley F. 299–303
Jonge, Henk Jan de 30
Jónsson, Sigurvin Lárus 31

Kalin, Everett R. 144 Kaminsky, Joel 20-21 Karris, Robert J. 269, 275 Kartzow, Marianne Bjelland 131 Keck, Leander E. 244, 290 Kee, Howard Clark 191 Keener, Craig S. 107, 227, 236, 239, 249, 251-254, 257-259 Keesmaat, Sylvia 180 Kerr, Fergus 255 Kidson, Lyn 27, 265, 268–269, 272–274, 276, 282-284 Kilpatrick, George D. 281 Kim, Kyu Seop 177, 179 Kim, Seyoon 80, 260 Kimber, Denise Buell 64, 271 Kimelman, Reuven 309 Kinman, Brent 222 Kinzig, Oskar Skar 289, 300, 304-308 Klauck, Hans-Josef 301, 306 Klijn, Albertus F. J. 291–307 Klinghardt, Matthias 156-157 Kloppenborg, John S. 132, 139 Koch, Dietrich-Alex 38, 55, 203 Koch, Klaus 203 Koehler, Ludwig 204 Koester, Craig R. 310 Koet, Bart J. 245 Kok, Michael 27-28, 153-154, 287, 293-295, 301, 306 Konradt, Matthias 14, 31-32 Korner, Ralph J. 128, 131

Kraemer, Ross S. 206 Kraft, Robert A. 267 Krauter, Stefan 207 Kremer, Jacob 244 Krodel, Gerhard 267 Krumer-Nevo, Michal 269 Kugel, James 163

Laato, Antti 158 Labahn, Michael 30, 127 Lampe, Peter 125 Landmesser, Christoph 61 Lange, Armin 53 Langer, Ruth 309 Langton, Daniel R. 4, 287–288 Lanier, Gregory R. 238 Last, Richard 129, 132–135, 137, 193 Lee-Linke, Sung-Hee 4

Lee-Linke, Sung-Free 4
Lehtipuu, Outi 127
Levenson, Jon D. 178, 239
Levine, Amy-Jill 92
Levine, Lee I. 198
Lewellen, Eric 19
Lewis, Robert B. 179
Lieu, Judith 14, 190
Lightfoot, Joseph B. 109, 151, 287, 289, 292, 302, 307

Lincicum, David 6, 14, 156 Lincoln, Andrew T. 69–71 Lindars, Barnabas 147 Lindbeck, George 120 Lindemann, Andreas 308 Lindsay, Hugh 179, 181 Litwa, M. David 159, 292 Litwak, Kenneth D. 238 Livesey, Nina E. 58–59 Loader, William 87 Löhr, Winrich A. 293

Longenecker, Bruce 5, 18, 20, 109, 134,

Longenecker, Richard N. 254 Lorenzen, Stefanie 38 Lüdemann, Gerd 46, 153, 287–288, 290–291, 293, 308, 310

Luomanen, Petri 153–154, 288–289, 290–293, 296–297, 299, 301–302, 304–309

Luther, Susanne 31

Luttikhuizen, Gerard P. 302

Maccoby, Hyam 45, 288, 291, 303–304, 310
MacDonald, Dennis 266, 280–281
MacDonald, Margaret Y. 69
MacDonald, Nathan 205
Magness, Jodi 191
Mairs, Rachel 52
Malkin, Irad 52
Maloney, Linda M. 248
Marcus, Joel 9, 192, 197, 309
Marguerat, Daniel 230, 232
Marjanen, Antti 153–154, 290

Marshall, John W. 139, 275–278 Martyn, Louis J. 107–108, 130, 193, 244

Marshall, Howard 249, 258, 260

Mason, Steve 8, 93–94
Maston, Jason 18, 19
Matlock, R. Barry 51
Mavor, Kenneth 96
McConville, J. Gordon 247
McCready, Wayne O. 9
McDermott, Gerald R. 143
McDonald, Denys 64–65, 68
McKechnie, Paul 265, 277
McKinney, Ken 230

McKnight, Scot 3, 8, 18–19, 21, 29, 116

McWhirter, Jocelyn 227 Meeks, Wayne A. 113, 129 Meißner, Stefan 4 Merkle, Benjamin L. 11 Metzger, Bruce M. 242, 251 Metzner, Rainer 29

McMurray, Patrick 177

Meyer, Nicholas 156 Meyer, Paul W. 113 Michel, Otto 255 Milgrom, Jacob 169 Miller, David M. 8, 92, 147 Milligan, George 251

Mimouni, Calude 152, 289, 291, 294, 297,

299, 301–302, 305–309 Minear, Paul S. 227 Mitchell, Alan C. 195, 199 Mitchell, Margaret M. 149 Mitchell, Stephen 265

Moessner, David Paul 221, 230, 254

Moffitt, David M. 156, 159–160
Montefiore, Claude 175
Moo, Douglas J. 110–111, 114, 116
Moore, Carey A. 205
Morgan-Wynne, John E. 237
Morris, Leon 239, 254
Mosser, Carl 237
Moule, C. F. D 244
Moulton, James H. 251
Mouritsen, Henrik 171, 175
Munck, Johannes 4, 143
Munck, W. D. 255
Murry, Michelle 309
Mussner, Franz 110
Myers, Jason A. 3

Nanos, Mark 3, 7–8, 15, 19, 46–49, 56, 100, 102, 116, 119, 129, 136-139, 141, 148, 169, 172–173, 198, 209, 211–213, 235, 288 Nasrallah, Laura 14 Newman, Carey C. 39, 235, 256, 260 Nickelsburg, George W. E. 253 Nicklas, Tobias 30, 38, 296 Nickle, Keith 143–144 Niebuhr, Karl-Wilhelm 10, 21–22, 29–37, 39-40, 42-43, 45, 75, 87, 141, 150, 201, 206-207 Niehaus, Jeffrey J. 255 Nienhuis, David R. 19 Nijf, Onno van 269 Nikki, Nina 127 Nobbs, Alanna 268, 277 Novenson, Matthew V. 8-10, 29, 51, 92-94, 97, 99, 134, 141-144, 151, 157, 235, 244, 246, 256

O'Brien, Peter T. 6, 77
O'Brien, Sara 104
Oakes, Penelope J. 95
Oegema, Gerbern S. 253
Ogereau, Julien M. 143, 280
Öhler, Markus 13, 56, 135, 138, 169, 191, 192
Oliver, Isaac W. 151–152, 220–222, 226, 233, 236
Olson, John C. 14
Olsson, Birger 129, 132

Olyan, Saul M. 4 Omerzu, Heike 29 Ophir, Adi 64–65 Oropeza, B. J. 3, 8, 18, 116, 156 Oswalt, John 253 Overman, J. Andrew 8, 84

Paget, James C. 290-295, 297-303, 308 Pahl, Michael W. 251 Pao, David W. 228, 231, 232, 244 Patte, Daniel 123 Patterson, Jane L. 139 Paul, C. E. 188 Pearson, Brook W. R. 4 Peerbolte, L. J. Lietaert 79 Penner, Todd 142 Peppard, Michael 177 Pervo, Richard I. 255, 258, 268, 280-283 Peters, Janelle 26, 187, 197 Peterson, David 248 Pietersen, Lloyd K. 269 Pilhofer, Peter 46 Pilhofer, Phillip 280–281 Pitre, Brant 18 Pitts, Andrew W. 51, 237 Platow, Michael J. 95 Plietzsch, Susanne 205 Pollefeyt, Didier 76 Portenhauser, Friederike 37 Porter, Christopher A. 24, 91, 94-95, 104, 130 Porter, Stanley E. 4, 51, 81, 211, 237 Pritchard, Evans 122-123 Pritz, R. A. 289, 297, 300, 304-307, 309, 310

Quartly, Marian 104 Quinn, Jerome D. 268, 274–275

Radl, Walter 229 Räisänen, Heikki 155 Rajak, Tessa 163 Ramsay, William 281 Ray, Jerry L. 238 Reasoner, Mark 20–21 Reed, Annette Yoshiko 9, 149, 154 Regev, Eyal 169, 173, 188, 198 Reicher, Stephen D. 95, 103–104 Reinhartz, Adele 9 Reinink, Gerrit J. 291–307 Rese, Martin 244 Reynolds, Benjamin E. 248 Richardson, Peter 132 Riesner, Rainer 82 Ritschl, Albrecht 287, 289, 292, 302 Roberts, C. H. 281 Roberts, Jimmy J. M. 141 Rochester, Kathleen M. 80 Rock, Ian E. 162 Rosenblum, Jordan 206 Rosen-Zvi, Ishay 64-65 Rosner, Brian S. 15, 23, 75, 80, 83-84, 87–88, 95, 101–102, 126, 138 Roth, Dieter T 45 Rothschild, Claire K. 245 Rowe, Christopher K. 243, 258 Rudolph, David J. 9, 102, 120, 143, 144 Ruffatto, Kristine 154 Runesson, Anders 47, 120, 131–132, 140, 147-148 Runia, David T. 30, 41 Rvkin, Ellis 45 Ryan, Jordan 131

Said, Edward 121, 123 Salmeri, Giovanni 269 Sanders, E. P. 2, 5-6, 9-10, 12, 13, 17-19, 126, 206, 248, 309 Sandnes, Karl O. 79, 130 Saunders, T. B. 50 Scaer, Peter J. 249, 254 Schäfer, Peter 159 Schechter, Solomon 308 Schellenberg, Ryan 183 Schiffman, Lawrence H. 159, 309 Schlier, Heinrich 109 Schließer, Benjamin 31, 56 Schliski, Volkhard 4 Schmeller, Thomas 38 Schmidt, Eckart D. 29 Schmidtke, Alfred 300, 308 Schmithals, Walter 152 Schneemelcher, Wilhem 272, 294 Schnelle, Udo 30, 210 Schoeps, Hans-Joachim 288, 290–291,

297-299, 301-302, 308, 310

Scholem, Gershom 159–160 Schrage, Wolfgang 45, 211, 213-214 Schröter, Jens 13-14, 48, 218, 262, 295 Schütz, John H. 210 Schwartz, Daniel R. 45, 75, 128, 172, 201 Schwemer, Anna Maria 55 Scott, Ian W. 109 Scott, James M. 81-82, 109, 179 Scullion, John J. 259 Segal, Ben-Zion 158 Segovia, Carlos A. 7, 16, 113, 152, 236 Seifrid, Mark 6, 77, 116 Semler, Johann S. 50 Seufert, Michael 203 Shanks, Hershel 153 Shapiro, Alan 271 Sheinfeld, Shayna 113, 148 Sheridan, Ruth 6, 14, 156 Sidi, Mirit 269 Siegal, Michel Bar-Asher 100 Silva, Moises 242 Simon, M. 310 Singer, Peter N. 269 Skarsaune, Oskar 149, 152-154, 210, 290-295, 297-303, 308 Sleeman, Matthew 227 Smith, Anthony D. 51–52 Smith, Brandon D. 235, 257 Smith, Dennis A. 202 Smith, Murray J. 27, 235 Snyder, Julia A. 243 Spielman, Loren R. 207 Sprinkle, Preston M. 4, 6 Stang, Charles M. 6, 14, 156 Stanley, Christopher D. 51, 54-55, 121 Stanton, Graham 299-300 Staples, Jason A. 8, 92, 110, 115, 120 Starling, David I. 24, 107, 109-110, 112, 115, 120, 142, 147 Stein, Robert H. 260 Steinhauser, Michael 125 Sterling, Gregory E. 14, 30, 72 Steyn, Gert J. 244 Stichele, Caroline V. 242 Stone, Michael E. 238, 240, 256, 261 Stott, Doug 82 Stowers, Stanley K. 47, 156

Strecker, Georg 45, 75, 153, 294, 299, 301, 306
Strotmann, Angelika 35
Stuhlmacher, Peter 83, 238, 239

Sturdy, John 4, 53 Sumney, Jerry L. 136, 139, 177–178 Sutter Rehmann, Luzia 202, 204–205

Swain, Shurlee 104

Tajfel, Henri 94-95 Talbert, Charles H. 227 Tanaseanu-Döbler, Ilinca 34 Tannehill, Robert C. 232 Taylor, Joan E, 153, 277 Taylor, Justin 17 Tervahauta, Ulla 131 Theißen, Gerd 210 Thiessen, Jacob 6 Thiessen, Matthew 9, 10, 16, 58, 63, 65, 100, 138, 150, 159–160, 170, 174 Thiselton, Anthony C. 209–210, 212–213 Thompson, Dorothy 52 Thompson, Leonard L. 267 Thonemann, Peter 284 Thornton, Dillion T. 274 Thorsteinsson, Runar 138 Tigay, Jeffrey 179 Tiwald, Markus 45, 169, 201 Tomson, Peter J 15, 112, 139, 150, 289 Towner, Philip H. 273 Trebilco, Paul 267–269 Trick, Bradley R. 110 Troost-Cramer, Kathleen 142 Tucker, Brian J. 16, 24, 102–103, 116, 119–120, 123–127, 129, 138–139, 268 Turner, John C. 95, 244 Turner, Max 244

Ueberschaer, Nadine 31 Ullicci, Daniel 4

Van Voorst, Robert E. 299–300, 303 Vanderkam, James C. 8, 84, 253 Vanlaningham, Michael G. 126 Verheyden, Joseph 301–303, 307, 310 Vielhauer, Philipp 301, 306 Vollenweider, Samuel 51, 53 Vorholt, Robert 38 Vos, Geerhardus 158, 241, 264

Wacker, William C. 268, 274 Wagner, J. Ross 115–116 Wall, Robert W. 30, 274 Walters, James C. 177–178 Walton, Steve 243–244, 251 Warfield, Benjamin B. 241 Warren, David H. 231 Wasserman, Emma 4

Watson, Francis 6, 10, 112, 124–128, 136 Wedderburn, Alexander J. M. 46–47

Wegener, Bernhard 4 Weiss, Zeev 198

Welborn, L. L. 195, 198 Wendel, Susan J. 147, 232

Wenger, Stefan 34 Wenham, David 244 Westerholm, Stephen 6

Whitaker, G. H. 34, 36 White, Aaron W. 244

White, Adam G. 96, 98, 269 White, Benjamin L. 149, 283, 292

Whitley, Thomas J. 293 Wilk, Florian 38, 56 Williams, Logan 148 Williamson, Paul R. 238

White, Devin L. 76

Willitts, Joel 109 Wilson, R. McL. 294

Wilson, Robert L. 272 Wilson, Stephen G. 289–291, 302, 305,

307, 309-310

Wilson, Walter T. 66-67

Windsor, Lionel J. 79, 117, 124, 138

Winter, Bruce 195, 269 Wischmeyer, Oda 45 Witherington, Ben 3, 254 Wolfgang, Grünstäudl 100 Wolfgang, Müller-Funk 162 Wolfgang, Schrage 45, 211 Wolfson, Elliot R. 159 Woyke, Johannes 7

Wright, N. T. 3, 5–6, 10, 17, 19, 21, 45, 109–110, 126–127, 210, 239, 241, 262

Xeravits, Géza G. 206

Yarbrough, Robert W. 77–78 Yee, Tet-Lim N. 67, 70 Yinger, Kent L. 5 Young, Norman H. 157 Young, Stephen L. 253

Zanker, Paul 271 Zehnder, Markus 248 Zeller, Dieter 210, 214 Zenger, Erich 144, 247
Zetterholm, Karin H. 15, 47, 140, 148, 198
Zetterholm, Magnus 7–8, 15, 18, 46–47, 116, 129, 132, 141, 148, 173, 198, 209, 235, 288
Zimmermann, Christiane 35, 265, 282
Zoccali, Christopher 100, 101, 120
Zurawski, Jason 261

Index of Subjects

Abraham 25, 60, 66, 83, 108, 161, 167, commensality 15, 16, 23, 26, 56, 57, 98, 103, 151, 194, 202ff, 305 176, 179, 183, 271 - see also lineage of Abraham conversion 168, 174-175 - see also seed of Abraham of Gentiles 87, 111, 170 court 196, 199 Adam 298 adoption 177-179, 181, 293 covenant 17, 24, 74, 119, 167-168 - covenantal identity 122, 126-127 Aeneas 162 Ammonites 163 - covenantal nomism 289 angel Christology 277, 294 creation 35-36, 41-42, 196, 245, 263 anthropology 40 new creation 22, 61, 175, 185 anti-Pauline writings 287 creator 245, 263, 304 anti-Semitism 4, 12 cross 39, 69, 239 Antioch 55, 57 cults, pagan 100 apostasy see apostate apostate 45, 61, 75, 99, 227 Davidic lineage 220, 262 apostleship of Paul 23, 38, 73, 75, 77, 84, death of Jesus see cross 86, 193, 272-273 defilement 203 archangel Michael 277 diaspora, Jewish 51, 60, 97, 105, 207-208, ascension of Jesus 249 asceticism 285 dietary laws 194, 205, 208, 295-296 assemblies, Pauline 133, 144, 194-196, dog 99-101 200, 201 Ebionites 152-154, 287ff baptism 63, 73, 280, 284, Elchasaites 301-302 - of Jesus 293, 295 election 85 birkat ha-minim 308 emperor 2242 blessing 182, 226, 234 encratites 284 blood 251-252 enthronement 225, 228, 234, 241, 248 boasting 111 epiphany 255-258, 260 Essenes 132 calling of Paul 79, 227, 236 ethnicity 7, 22, 48-53, 209, 212, 214, 218, celibacy 298 Christology 31, 43-44, 46, 218 essentialist conceptions of ethnicity 53 - high Christology 27, 46, 235-236, 255, - ethnic transformation 23, 50, 63-65, 263-264, 296 churches (building) 191 ethnocentrism 47, 287 circumcision 10, 18, 22, 58-60, 62, 111, eucharist 279, 284 140, 150, 152, 171, 173 Eutychos 265-266 collection for Jerusalem 143-144, 196, exile 116

exodus 180, 252

290

faith 14, 74, 250 father, as divine predicate 35, 36, 178–179 flesh 156, 278 flogging of Paul 187 food 203–204, 274 – offered to idols 267 freedom 203, 210–211, 215

glory of God 78, 81, 82, 89, 256 God fearers 133, 135, 136, 172, 174 grace 22, 32, 42

Hebrew Bible 31, 46, 76, 84, 234, 236–238, 263
henotheism 137
Herakles 164
herald of good news 77, 82
Herod the Great 172
high priest 68, 69, 303
history of Israel see story of Israel
history of research on Paul 1–7, 31, 130
Holy Spirit see spirit
household churches 268–269
human mortality 157, 158–159

identity markers, Jewish 62, 84 idolatry 11, 78, 86, 184, 203, 267 image of God 39 immorality, sexual 86–88 immortality 40 impurity 159–160, 206 inclusion of Gentiles 32, 69, 72, 114, 116, 117, 120, 124–125, 129, 171, 176, 184–185 infancy narrative 219, 220, 223 inheritance 183, 186 Israel 8, 24, 108, 112, 118, 126, 155, 167, 178

eschatological 121, 126, 142, 222, 226
 Izates 172
 Jerusalem 142, 220, 220
 Izates death are gross

Israel see also remnant

Jesus' death see cross Jewish revolt 187 Judah Maccabee 94 judaizing 16, 17, 27, 48, 59, 93, 94, 97, 104, 138, 173–174 Judean 92 judgment 232, 233, 247–249 justification 117, 157, 254

king David 219-220, 228, 237

- see also Davidic lineage
kinship 25, 66, 74, 161, 164, 166, 177

- see also lineage of Abraham

land of Israel 92, 173 law of Christ 103 life, eternal 40 light 34–35, 38, 41 lineage of Abraham 164–165, 167–168, 184, 185, 271 liturgy 190

manumission inscriptions 133
marriage 274, 284, 298
meals see commensality
memory of Paul 266ff
Messiah 27, 217ff, 237, 238, 253, 263
Middle-Platonism 34
Moabites 163
monotheism 9, 225, 246
Montanists 284
Moses 164

Nazarenes 152–154, 287ff New Perspective on Paul 5–7, 46 Nicene Creed 306 Noachide laws 139 Nostra Aetate 18 Novations 284

Old Testament see Hebrew Bible olive tree 72, 74

parousia 158
Passover 301
Pauline biography 273
persecution of Paul 13, 195, 197, 218, 230
Pharisees 10, 24, 53, 97, 102, 188, 189, 192, 195, 211, 218, 303
pilgrimage 207
– eschatological pilgrimage 24–25, 119–120, 140–142, 144
poverty 300

pre-existence of Jesus 241, 292 priest 77, 80 prophet 77, 79, 221, 228, 230, 238 – eschatological prophet 219, 221 proselytes 15, 60, 66–67, 73, 120, 168, 170–173, 184, 303 punishment of Paul see persecution of Paul purity 191, 199–200, 203, 282

rabbinic Judaism 53, 58, 175
Radical New Perspective on Paul 7
remnant, eschatological 81, 113, 122
repentance 250
resident alien 169
restoration of Israel 114
resurrection 158, 188, 218, 223–226, 234, 240, 246, 249, 254, 274, 278
righteous 253–255, 262
Roman empire 125, 127, 164
Ruth 169

Sabbath 139, 205, 207, 277-278 sacrifices 203, 298-299 salvation see soteriology salvation-history 88, 108-109, 220 saviour 242, 245, 262 Scripture see Hebrew Bible seed of Abraham 110, 165, 177, 182 segmentary identity 128 separationist Christology 294 servant, Isaianic 77, 78, 228, 238, 254, 259, 261 sexual renunciation 283 sin 18, 19, 87, 169–170, 243, 263 Sinai 244, 256, 258, 260 slaves 207 social identity theory 91, 94-96 soldiers, Jewish 207-208 son of god 240-241, 245, 304 son of man 248, 260 Sonderweg 7, 110 soteriology 32, 33, 37, 41, 59, 72, 77, 88, 113, 220, 223, 232

Spartans 164–165 spirit 155, 156, 159, 181, 198, 229, 243, 293 Stoa 66 story of Israel 111, 118, 126, 219, 224 suffering of the Messiah 238–239, 245 supersessionism 19–21, 166 sympathizers see God fearers synagogue 24, 26, 56–57, 119–120, 128–130, 131–136, 147, 187ff, 198 – in Israel 188

in the diaspora 189

table fellowship see commensality
Tarsus 96
temple 85, 86, 170, 172, 173, 188, 190
- Samaritan temple 190
- eschatological temple 82
Thecla 280–283
theophany see epiphany
Therapeutae 132, 307
third race 11, 49, 64, 70, 279
Torah 9–11, 15, 18, 25, 70, 147, 150, 151, 154–156, 200–201, 208

- observance 14, 26, 48, 58, 102–103, 147, 148–149, 152, 212–215, 276, 305–310
- observance of Gentiles 137, 138
- reading 131, 191

universalism 61

vegetarianism 303 veils 197 virgin 283 virgin conception of Jesus 291, 293, 296–297

weak 210, 212 wine 206 works of the law 5, 27, 177, 311

yahad 85

Zion 142, 144